



northern
beaches
council

MINUTES

NORTHERN BEACHES COUNCIL MANLY PARKING PERMIT ENGAGEMENT SESSION

held at Manly Town Hall on

TUESDAY 10 SEPTEMBER 2019

Minutes of the Northern Beaches Council Manly Parking Permit Engagement Session held on Tuesday 10 September 2019

At Manly Town Hall

Commencing at 10am

ATTENDANCE:

Emily Carson	Manager – Community Transport & Parking Operations
James Brocklebank	Engineer – Traffic (South Area)
Claudia Brodtke	Minute Taker
Phillip Devon	Manager – Transport Network
Lisa Trewin	Community Engagement Officer
Michelle Carter	Strategic Transport Coordinator
Patrick Bastawrous	Traffic Engineering Coordinator
Matthew Creus	Ranger
Clive Silverster	Ranger
Don Morales	IT Officer Administration & Special Projects

Meeting Start Time: 9.00am

Michelle Carter: So its 10:00 now and we will get started with the presentation. I really welcome you here today to Manly Town Hall and to the information session for the parking permit framework. First, I would just like to acknowledge the traditional owners, and the country on which we gather here today. Some standard housekeeping, we have bathrooms just out in the hallway here for the women, and the gents are in the back hallway behind us. If there is an emergency, follow our direction and we will go to Corso and we will meet just outside Saint Matthews Church.

I always ask, as Council staff are here today to talk to you with respect and treat you with respect in all of our dealings, and we do ask the same from the members here today. We are here to provide an overview of the Northern Beaches Parking Permit framework, which was endorsed by Council at the meeting in August. It is also an opportunity for you to ask questions from us, we have one hour scheduled today, but we may go over time. So please, if we go over time, your questions will be answered but if you have to leave, please post your questions online and we will be able to answer it that way.

Just a quick introduction of staff that we have here today. As I mentioned I am Michelle, and this is Phil Devon my manager, he is the manager of the Transport Network Team. We have our formal minute taker

Claudia here today. We have a member from the Engagement team, Parking Operations, Ranger Enforcement and our IT person Don just in case anything goes wrong. He is here to make sure everything keeps on track. I also have members here today from the Transport Network team - we have Council Engineers - you may know James Brocklebank who is the Manly Ward Based Council Engineer.

In case you have not noticed, we are recording the session today - there will not be visual face recording of the members here today, but it will capture all of the audio from today and then this will be loaded on our Your Say page, so that everyone has an opportunity to see and hear the conversation of all of the three information sessions that we have held. There are going to be many questions today, and all of these will be captured through the video and through the minutes. Just so we can keep to time I just ask that any questions outside of I guess the parking permit framework, that we hold until after the meeting. We are more than happy to talk to you on those. When you are asking a question, you would have had a number allocated to you, we will give you a microphone, so please speak clearly into the microphone so that it can be captured on the audio. Anything not in the microphone will not be captured on the audio, so please only speak if you have the microphone so we can capture all of your comments. Emily here will be walking around with the microphone, so keep an eye out for her. I will hand you over to Phil now and he will just start with some of the presentation today. Thank you.

Phil Devon - Good morning everyone, thanks for coming. I am starting to lose my voice so I am going to hand over to Michelle during the presentation. Council endorsed the parking framework to go on public exhibition at the August meeting. There has been a little bit of confusion around how it applies, so part of today is clarifying how the actually applies to existing Manly schemes. So the Northern Beaches is a parking permit scheme framework, which addresses the RMS mandatory guidelines. Currently Manly's the only area that has residence parking schemes in place, and this draft framework applies to any new parking scheme that we establish on the northern beaches. We get numerous requests from other areas - Dee Why Queenscliff, Frenches Forest - particularly with the new hospital opening - so that's why we've chosen to go to a framework that applies across the whole LGA, not just to rectify the issues with the Manly schemes. What we are purposing with the Manly schemes is a staged implementation - so linking the rego to properties and owners at this stage. Council's resolution is another issue that has come up recently, around how it is worded - the way it has been brought out in public is that the Framework does not address the resolution. The resolution's intent is to note that the framework does not apply directly to the Manly schemes from Day One. It is a staged process, and we are not linking the number of off streets spaces to the permit in the initial phase of the project.

Michelle Carter - We have already conducted community engagement during Stage 1 and that was just getting information from the community. We had some stakeholder meetings with the residents groups, and with the Manly Business Chamber, the Greater Manly Resident Forum, and Manly Community Forum and Manly Resident Group meetings.

We had the Your Say Page online, so that was where people had the opportunity to comment through the Your Say page. We had many people write directly to us as well, with comments. We had questions online, and downstairs in the training room we had drop-in sessions where we had many sticky notes and maps of the area, and we captured all the comments through that way. Therefore, we had around 340 odd people come through, so it was a big interest in this project, and we captured a lot of information through that. All of the information that we captured and every posted note comment has been formatted into the community engagement report, and that's available on the Your Say Page so everyone can view every comment and see what discussions and what thoughts are out there within the community.

Phil Devon - The On-Street spaces which the Rangers and other staff have been at, and actually measured the curb space, so we know exactly how many compliant parking spaces there are on every street within the scheme areas; and that will allow us in the future to work out, "Okay, you can't fit a car in there, but what's the most appropriate use for that part of the curb as well?" Therefore, it might be that if you have three meters between driveways you can get a couple of motor bikes there or something like that. When we have gone out and done the off-street audits - where we have been able to - we have actually used from a technical perspective, a B-99 vehicle criteria - which is a large van or sedan given the space. So if you cannot park a large sedan, we have not counted that. Therefore, the old 1930's garage not been counted - many of the old unit blocks, you cannot get more than a car in the garage.

Okay, so what the draft framework recommendations include is linking the vehicle registration to an address. Therefore, the vehicle must be registered to an address - reducing permits per rate of the dwelling. Therefore, one thing that came out on Saturday for instance was a block of four units that is not strata'd is only one rateable property. Therefore, that was one of those special considerations. Many of the older blocks in Manly work like that, so we are going to have to address that prior to going back to Council.

As I discussed business permit eligibility, we are also introducing the new permit types. Part of the reason we are introducing the new permit types is certain permits do not count to the aggregated total under the RMS guidelines. The permit types will be a residential permit - currently what you have now, a visitor permit - it's a trial to see how it works - which is the scratching system - Michelle has bought some to show later. The business permits as we have discussed. A trades person permit - so if getting minor works done a couple of days to a week that's the one to use - if you get any renovations done, a Work Zone works out cheaper and more effective for the builders. Support workers and carers - so support workers go to like home nursing services and that sort of thing - a carer's permit is for a family members who is looking after a relative in line with the Carers Act - that is the eligibility. It's not a free for all - we set it, it's not a tight eligibility - but it's a sensible eligibility so you're not handing them out left, right, and centre; but it's for people who actually have somebody looking after them in their own home. Car share- because we acknowledge that car share is actually part of the transport mix in Manly - you've got families that don't have cars, but use car share providers when they do need a car, and organizational permits, like the Yacht Club for instance, they get some permits for the Sailability group, which is one of those organizations that actually provide a service to those people in the community.

What we are wading through now is that we need to sit down and have discussions with the actual organizations to work at what they actually need, and whether they are eligible others.

One of the causes of disagreement now is the fee for the first permit - because we are changing the type of permit that we will be using, so it is not a hanging a plastic thing in your wind screen anymore, it is actually a sticker to stop fraud - we print them on high quality digital printers, we have a sticker based system. The cost of the stickers, including printers and all that sort of stuff, the \$47 does not cover the cost. Its partial cost recovery.

We are still keeping the third permit, and the \$47 across the board, it is the same as what we charge for Western Foreshores permits and many of the other individual permits that we have on the Northern Beaches. Visitors permits in packs of five and 10. The car share permit will be for, it is not for the Pop Car vehicles now, it is for Go-Get, and they would have a floating system. One of the things from a customer service perspective is the permits do not go missing in the mail; we will be charging \$10 to have them sent out by registered post. That way no one can raid the letterbox and get them, somebody has to sign for them.

Michelle Carter – We are on the second week of the exhibition period for the draft framework, so the comments will close on the 29th of September - we are undertaking engagement with our community- so that is why people are here today, and we have the information session Saturday and one more tomorrow. This is an opportunity for people to comment- we're also undertaking internal engagement as well, so we're meeting with our Rangers team, who are on the ground enforcing or patrolling the streets in Manly as to how the scheme will work for them, what changes will impact on them, and how to make their job easier, and we're engaging with Customer Service as well. They are the team that you will go through and you will meet with them when you apply for your permit, or they will process the permit for you - so we are making sure we can get a system in place that is better managed for everybody as well, and that means for the community and for the Customer Service team. We will review all of the submissions and comments that come through. Following the 29th of September we'll go through all of your letters and Your Say comments, all of the questions, all of the feedback that we get from you today as well, we'll take all of that into consideration.

We need to report to Council on the final parking permit framework - we can do this during the time from when the engagement finishes - and going back to Council - we can make amendments to the framework, but we also need to consider the RMS guidelines and what the schemes are in place for. So it is not an open opportunity to do anything, we do have to work within the guidelines when we introduce the draft framework.

What we will do, once we get council adoption of the framework - we are proposing to implement the scheme starting with Little Manly on 1 February next year. That is the next scheme that will renew. So from the first of February, with Little Manly they'll start to have the new application process, they'll have the new look permit, and then we will move through each scheme area; and we have made some changes to the renewal periods just to make it easier for you, and a more enjoyable experience coming in to Customer Service. There are not as many queues, it is quite a busy time, and so we are just staggering out the renewals just so it is easier once again for Customer Service and for you as well. You can actually learn a lot more about the project on the Your Say Page, so we have all of the documents on here for you to view. You can also have the information here, the address, where to make a submission, and the information sessions that are coming up, so you're more than welcome to come back tomorrow evening at 6:00 PM, we'll be here going through the same information. We can also answer your questions online, so you can post them in the online forum, and we will provide a response. You can also read all of the questions that other people have been asking as well, and you may find that your question has already been answered.

Therefore, the related documents have a fair bit of information relating to this project - the most important documents will be the RMS permit parking guidelines. Therefore, I suggest that you read those if you are not familiar with them, read through them so you have an understanding of how these schemes work and how Council proposes to manage the scheme within Manly and across the Northern Beaches.

Read the framework, we have copies here today, so please take a copy with you. We have copies of the RMS permit parking guidelines as well that you can take away with you. The agenda as well for the August meeting is available, the agenda and minutes, so read through that information, and if you're really interested you can read through all the comments from the community engagement reports from Stage One, just to get an understanding of what's been said in the community and what other people are feeling.

So what we will do now, we have had time that we have spoken to you, so we would really like to open the floor up to the questions. Therefore, as I said, we will be going in the numbering system, and we can only take questions from those who have the microphone, just so your audio is captured. Therefore, we will start with question number one.

Audience (Speaker One): Okay. Hello, I've lived in my house for 40 years, I'm in the Ivanhoe Park Precinct where there is no problem with parking, in fact your numbers said that it's nearly the same number of permits as there are spots; and we're a multi-generational family, I've got my grandchildren and children living with me, and last year I put in a double car port, so now I'm going to be penalized of that, because if I have parking for two cars I'm no longer allowed to apply for any permits. So, what do I say to my son-in-law who lives with me? How can he get to Bankstown every morning by 7:00 AM? What can we do? What is the answer? You are punishing the residents that have lived here for such a long time that have their children live with them. The people in my age group, you have children who come and stay, I have relatives in the country that come and stay, and I am not going to know that they are coming on Saturday a week for one night. What do you suggest I do? I am being heavily penalized for putting an extra car spot. The people in the street who only have one car space can apply for three stickers. It is very unfair and I feel very angry about it.

Michelle Carter: Thank you. It is difficult managing parking demand for everyone in an area that has high demand for parking. I do not know, I cannot answer the question as to what you yourself would do in that case. What we can look at in the next stage of this project is the time restrictions within the scheme areas, at the moment they finish at 10:00 PM and with engagement with the community, perhaps the end time of the parking scheme will reduce, that could help with overnight parking in the area; but in terms of these individual cases that are very unique to each people, and it's difficult to manage each situation

Audience: Can I just say that having many children living with families now in the economic circumstances is not going to be unique to me; there are many people here who will have more than two cars in their families.

Michelle Carter: Thank you for your comments. Question number two?

Audience (Speaker Two): Yeah, hi. We live in the area adjacent to Stella Maris, and consequently we have a load of young women who want to park their cars in our street all the time. That's not a problem out of hours, because they're not there out of hours; but like our lady here, we have children at home who have their own vehicles and have to travel distances to go to work. In the past parking on the verge, where you've got a strip of driveway between the gutter and your front property, I think that the council Rangers very nicely have turned a blind eye to that and allowed that to occur without being penalized, is that going to continue?

Michelle Carter: We have to enforce Australian Road Rules so I would say that no, they would need to enforce that.

Audience: So in the street that I live in I reckon that there is probably about six people who park on the verge, so where are they going to park.

Michelle Carter: Is it formal kerb and gutter?

Audience: Yes, it is.

Michelle Carter: So parking on the verge between the driveway and the gutter, like over the footpath?

Audience: Yes

Michelle Carter: Yeah, unfortunately, that would need to be enforced; we cannot allow that to continue.

Audience: Okay, where are the other six odd people now going to park their vehicles?

Michelle Carter: Okay, thank you. Number three?

Audience (Speaker Three): Thank you, [REDACTED] is my name. First, I think I speak for everyone in the room; we support the Black Market, right? Get rid of it, we support what you are doing there. A point of issue I am going to take, I co-chair Greater Manly Resident's Forum, you have said you have consulted with us, either we all were drunk that night, asleep, or did not listen. We were not consulted with. You might have said we are going to try and get rid of the Black Market, which we supported; but to come up with what you have come up with, no you did not consult with Greater Manly Resident's Forum first off, okay. I do have a number of issues, first boats and caravans, what happens to those? In addition, I live on the same street as the man who just spoke, and you will get a boat, you will get a caravan, you go, "What the hell do we do?" Please clarify that is the first question.

Phil Devon: Okay, under the proposed framework they will be no boat or trailer permits issued, because the primary goal of the scheme is to provide parking for the residents, and I think we issued less than 20 a year anyway.

Audience: Okay, next question I've got, Phil I've asked you this now eight times, I'm going to ask you again. How did you come up with the definition of off street parking? Like the first lady, we are exactly the same situation, and I think what's happened is that you haven't respected the fact that we've developed our properties in line with the heritage issues of Manly, of the former Manly Council. Now at first glance you would look at my property and think he has four parks, you cannot get cars in there because that area was developed 100 years ago. Cars were fewer, cars were smaller. Now I know you did not come onto my property, how did you come up with a very specific number of 1,163 off street parking in the Ocean Beach Precinct?

Phil Devon: Okay, some of them have been calculated by the DA approvals for new buildings, where you have a driveway apron in front of the garage that would hold a vehicle, which counted as one...

Audience: Come on get serious.

Phil Devon: Under the definition...

Audience: There is a car parked in your driveway how do you get the other one in?

Phil Devon: Yeah, under the RMS guidelines that is how it is calculated

Audience: Okay, you kept saying, I will try to keep on track, because you kept saying RMS guidelines. Guidelines isn't mandatory is it?

Phil Devon: They are mandatory guidelines.

Audience: They are mandatory guidelines.

Phil Devon: Yes.

Audience: Okay. The RMS don't own all the roads in Manly, are you still obliged to follow the guidelines despite the fact that the RMS do not own all the roads?

Phil Devon: The simple answer is yes. Okay? The way it works is that if we provide a scheme for approval that RMS don't agree with, we take it to traffic committee, RMS sit on the traffic committee. If RMS does not support it, but the committee approves it, RMS has the option of taking us to the regional traffic committee to have it overturned.

Audience: Well I suggest you fight on our behalf. I really do. Okay? You have no idea how divisive this policy is, how un-family, I do not there is such a word, but I think you know what I mean, what you are doing. I am in the same situation as the first speaker; I have adult children at home that need a vehicle to earn a living. Okay? Where do we park? Now, this is one that I know my colleague has as well, tandem parking. You have probably counted it as three or four parks in my situation, I have at the front, how do I get all the cars out, where do I park them then to get my car out? Then I have to double-park them and get them all back in do I? Because you are giving me zero permits.

Phil Devon: Yeah. How do individuals manage the parking on their own property? We obviously do not control that.

Audience: Phil, please do not say that. Please, you have to do better than that.

Phil Devon: Yeah. In the initial stage of the scheme, you will still be eligible for permits because we are not taking into account the off-street spaces.

Audience: Now, and this is what ... And you shouldn't keep saying initial, because what we're going is we're looking not one year in advance, we're looking two years in advance. Therefore, two years in advance we are not going to have the same situation that we have now.

Phil Devon: Part of the issues is that there has been too many permits issued.

Audience: Black market we support

Phil Devon: Yeah. Okay. One of the other options is that we extend that period for achieving compliance. Therefore, instead of being 12 months, we monitor it for two years, okay. That is not something that is in the current framework, but that is an option.

Audience: Okay. Now, we go back to rates. Our rates paid on the unimproved capital value, which are very high. So someone that doesn't pay as much rates as we do, for example in Bell Rose, can park boats, caravans, whatever they like on the street, but we can't. Now just think about the policy you are pursuing here, is it socialism? Come on people, you have to support us; you have to do better. Thank you.

Phil Devon: Thank you.

Audience (Speaker Four): Hello, I have lived in my own in Addison Road for over 40 years and it looks as if I've got a driveway, but it's not broad enough, when I get in with my car I can't open my door to get out, and I'm in my 80's now; and I'm quite worried as to what's going to happen. Will my house be assessed? Will I still be able to get my permits? Or what's the position when you get into this driveway, I've got a side entrance by the way, you enter my house from the side, so I don't know what I'm going to do if I'm assessed on that driveway, because it can't be called a driveway. So what will happen to me?

Michelle Carter: I think there may be a number of properties in a similar situation, we would have to look at each of those, a request to council we can review that situation for you. I understand that a one size fits all in terms of driveways and size of garages does not work in this situation just due to the older type of homes and driveways that have been constructed. So that's what we'll need to have a further discussion with you, or other people who may have a similar situation and see if yes that is indeed a fact, and how we can work around that for you.

Audience: One of the meetings, one of the earlier meetings downstairs, one of the girls said to me that you had photographed all the houses, is this right.

Michelle Carter: No, we have not photographed the houses.

Audience: Oh, you have not.

Michelle Carter: No.

Audience: She told me you had been around looking, and there were quite a few driveways similar to mine. My house is over 100 years old, and as I said it is a side entrance and if I get in with my car there's no way I can open my door.

Michelle Carter: Yeah, there are a lot like that. Therefore, that will have to be looked at differently to a more modern property that does have more room.

Audience: I am really quite concerned about it, because I am in my 80's myself, and I want to know where I stand. Okay.

Michelle Carter: Thank you.

Audience (Speaker 5): Yeah, I am interested to ascertain those people that do have tandem parking, and some of it is tight. In our situation, if you put a car behind the garage, part of the tail, a very small part is effectively on the footpath, I am talking a very small part. If the laws were enforced, we would be fined, so what tolerance can we expect, I would assume that I am one of many that probably have that, we are not blocking the footpath that is important to understand, what tolerance will council recommend to their Rangers to allow given this new parking permit scheme? Otherwise, we lose anything in front of our garage.

Michelle Carter: So look, we need to apply a consistent approach to enforcement right across the LGA, so we would need to enforce the Australian Road Rules to all properties.

Audience: Australian Road Rules relevant to one foot, two foot over a footpath.

Michelle Carter: Within your property boundary. You would need to be within your property boundary fully.

Audience: Well you will have to come and measure it then.

Michelle Carter: Well we have some Rangers here today who might, they can talk to you after the session today and speak further on the Road Rules regarding your situation, but we need to have a consistent approach.

Audience: You are not allowing any flexibility whatsoever. What I'm suggesting is if you adopted it was one foot, two foot, to allow to accommodate and to use these existing parking, just common sense rather than we must adhere to the-

Michelle Carter: Look I am saying we do, I am not here today to say that we will ignore any Australian Road Rules and enforcement, I cannot give you that confirmation that you are seeking.

Audience: Well I am not seeking confirmation. I am seeking a recommendation.

Michelle Carter: We cannot recommend anything outside of the Australian Road Rules. As I said, it is a fair consistent approach to enforcement everywhere. I suggest that you speak with the Rangers after the session today and get clarification from them.

Audience: Great.

Audience (Speaker Six): Yeah, right-o. I live in Little Manly, I was born in Manly Hospital, and I have been here for 60 years. The policy that you are going to adopt, it is already bad, and you are going to make it a lot worse. I have two cars, I'm a builder in Manly, I have four kids, two that I get a parking permit for my Ute, I have one for each of the kids, when you take them away, what do they do? Pay \$101 each day to leave their cars there? That is rubbish. These poor people have a legitimate concern about that you are trying to adopt; I think you have already adopted it, you are going to take this policy, you already made your minds up. I own a property in Manly down here on Pittwater Road and I pay \$10,000 a year in rates, not much, no. My son is my apprentice, my brother works with me, and I need a parking spot, what do I do?

Michelle Carter: Do you have off street parking where you live now? Where all your children live?

Audience: When I start building, no.

Michelle Carter: No. You can –

Audience: Then I have all the tradespeople coming down there.

Michelle Carter: Okay.

Audience: The concreters, form workers, carpenters, you name it, you do not live under a rock, you live in a house, you know what it takes to build a house, or a block of units. I do not know anybody that likes your policy; you are wasting your time and our money. You work for us; we do not work for you. Do something better about it.

Phil Devon: Thanks for that, we will take that on board.

Michelle Carter: I am just wondering as part of the DA process have you applied for a work zone that will give you dedicated building space during building hours outside the property.

Audience: No, I am in Kangaroo Lane and I am not eligible. What do I do bring it in my helicopter?

Emily Carson: We can talk to you later about your individual issues.

Audience (Speaker Seven): Hello, I am a mostly new resident here and I want to say thank you for doing this permit framework; because I do actually think it is a good thing. I live in Isthmus and we do not have any car spots, so we have actually had to for the past four years try to find parking and it has been difficult; but we have been okay. We have one car spot, there is two of us living in the house and we have interstate visitors quite often, not all my family live here. However, we have had to make it work, and there is not much parking, and with lots of permits being handed out it is a struggle. So for us, for people who don't have any car spots at all, we do need something to change because it's not fair that everybody gets thousands of car permits, and for the people who have no place to park, we're then penalized. So I understand that it must tough for you guys who have the car spots and lots of people that come and visit; but think of those who have no car spot at all, and I'm parked in Isthmus, where all the tourists come and park there as well. It is very difficult, so I am thankful for this permit scheme that you people are doing, and I really hope that it does help with making sure those lots of people who do not need car parks, or additional permits ... Yeah, there is not additional. I'm not saying that I don't think other people don't deserve additional permits if you've got four registered vehicles and you need two extra permits, I'm not saying you don't deserve them, I'm just saying it'd be nice to crack down a little bit more on it, that's all. I do have a question though, we, Victoria Parade, there's been quite a number of car spots that have been taken away, with this new scheme that you guys are doing are you looking at trying to make more parking spots available? Because obviously it is already tight to get a car spot and taking away spots is making it harder.

Michelle Carter: Yeah, definitely. I think in terms of taking away spaces, were they removed for no stopping, or no parking or you are not sure.

Audience: For no parking.

Michelle: For no parking.

Audience: Yes

Michelle Carter: James can answer that one about the removal of the spaces and why, then we will go the second part.

James Brocklebank: Sorry. There's been a few spaces removed in Victoria Parade, a couple of them weren't actually parking spaces, they were spots where people were parking across driveways, so we put in hatch markings to make it clearer that it's a driveway. There was also a couple of spaces that were taken away to improve site lines to a cycle path that runs through Victoria Parade, and uses up the cycle path and pedestrians on the foot path were unable to be seen by cars entering and exiting a driveway. But yes, we try, and limit any removal of spaces wherever possible.

Michelle Carter: Now the second part to that, we simply can't build more car parking stations. What we did hear a lot during the first stage was why don't we line mark the spaces better? To do that we would need to make the Australian Standards for car parking, which needs to be six meters for a parallel space. So you could end up losing spaces if you do that, but you would have a consistent number all the time, and that is what we will look at as well through this. But it can be difficult, there's no way to put more parking, we've got to work with what we've got, which is very limited, and I acknowledge Isthmus is probably the most in demand area at the moment.

Audience (Speaker Eight): Thank you for your time today. My concern is that one of your proposals was to take away 24 parking spots from the Southern end of Bower Street, did you inform residents on Randall

Cliff, Addison, and then North end of our street that those 24 cars would then be domino effecting onto those residents?

Michelle Carter: So, that proposal is outside of the resident parking permit scheme question, but James is here today, and he will be happy to talk to you after about why those parking spaces were removed and what engagement was carried out as well.

Audience: Okay, also I would just like to say that we are a family with four drivers, we've actually just spent an incredible amount of money to create a car parking off street; and now we are going to be penalized after spending all this money because our daughter's will be coming home from shift work at 2:00 in the morning and not being able to park on the street because they will be impacted by some of the proposals. So I think that's a huge safety concern that the council has to take into account is that there'll be residents walking a long way, because they can't park outside their residence; and something's going to happen to someone because of that, and you will need to take responsibility for that.

Michelle Carter: Okay, thank you.

Audience (Speaker Nine): Hi, my name is [REDACTED] I live in Malvern Avenue, which is an absolute nightmare, especially in the summer with the beach just nearby. I don't have a car, but I rent a car whenever I feel like I need one, especially if I have to go and see my mother and all that sort of thing, and if you are going to link registration numbers to permits, what am I going to do?

Michelle Carter: Would not the framework we are putting forward, it only covers really the car share; we have not considered the renting of a vehicle through a private hire car company.

Audience: Well I have quite a few friends who do the same thing.

Michelle Carter: There is an option within there that talks about a borrowed vehicle, so maybe that could be explored a little bit more.

Audience: Is that the \$220 thing?

Michelle Carter: No, that is not that one. If you do borrow a vehicle there is a consideration, and I think based on you not the first person to ask that question, so we could look at that one a little bit more and how if people like you, who do rent a private vehicle that's not a car share, how could the borrowed vehicle permit be managed to help residents who do hire a car?

Audience: I also think it's quite a discriminatory proposal that you've put up and it's a little bit to me like taking a sledgehammer, when the problem was the Black Market, which could have easily been stopped by having a specific number of permits available, people could just go down and get full permits, and sell them so I don't know why that wasn't just stopped before all this money and the extra \$57 a year that it's now going to cost us, if it's not going to cost more, why it wasn't looked at from the other way around? Which was what the problem is, how do we solve it, without all of a sudden we are being impacted incredibly detrimentally.

Phil Devon: Part of the issue with the number of permits is that there are criteria that we have to apply under the guidelines. Historically, the former Manly had not applied that criterion, hence why RMS has written to council to bring the schemes into line. It is not something that we have sort of sat in a room and decided to do ourselves, it's-

Audience: No, I am just wondering why the Black Market issue wasn't addressed? It just seems to me that the world has crashed down on us because some people were doing the wrong thing and council was not doing anything about it.

Phil Devon: Yeah, and part of the thing was that we were maintaining the status quo until we had done the audit to work out what the problem actually was, okay? Now, I do not think there are three and a half thousand permits for sale online. There is obviously an oversupply of permits generally, and that is part of the process we are going through now.

Audience: Well surely, that would have just meant limiting people to less permits.

Phil Devon: Yeah.

Audience: Instead of going through all this trauma, as you've seen, there are people here who are actually quite traumatized by this because they have developed their properties, or they have children living at home, or whatever, and it just seems insane to me that it's been this sledgehammer approach instead of addressing the original problem, which as the number of permits that you were allowing people to purchase.

Phil Devon: And that is what we are addressing is the number of permits.

Audience: Well, why by charging us and not giving us permits? What you have done is you have taken away permits from people who deserve permits. That is what it boils down to.

Phil Devon: And we are still looking at whether three permits is the right number.

Audience: No, no, no I am just talking about anyone. So if you take me, who does not have a registered car, then what people have to go through - If you are stopping people having permits ... Sorry I lost my train of thought then. It just seems discriminatory, and you are effecting the asset value of people's houses by them not being able to say that they have residential parking capability.

Audience: Rates should drop then.

Phil Devon: Because of the rates calculator on the unapproved capital value, I do not think rates will drop.

Audience (Speaker Ten): Hello there, my name is [REDACTED]. I live in the Ocean Beach, which used to be Ocean Beach North interestingly, and then it was combined with Ocean Beach, which I think in itself is something we need to look at again in the future, because the areas around Manly are all very localized and have very particular needs. The first thing I'd like to say is I really applaud the plan to put the registration numbers on the stickers, on the permits, I don't know that we needed this amount of consultation to decide on that, it was a fairly no brainer given the Black Market; but that's great that it's being done and I applaud it. But we must also have, in addition to permits with registration numbers marked on them, we must also have, it's imperative, that we have a pass, a permit which just has the address on it, the residential address. That would deal with the people for example, who do rent a car, or hire a car, or borrow a car, avoiding owning a car. The specific category permits that you are suggesting will not work. First, as I just said with the share cars and borrowed cars, unless they do it through one of your recognized shared car schemes, they will not be able to park their car near their house. Also for people who have adult children who come to stay, maybe they are at university, they own a car up Armidale, they come back for their holidays for six weeks, and they cannot park their car at their own home. An adult child who lives away, who is registered in

another town who is coming back regularly to have chemotherapy for three weeks at a time, where do they park? The visitor parking will not work, the scratchy scheme that you are suggesting is absolutely unfair and unworkable, and it is going to be an administrative nightmare. It doesn't allow, it's anti-your own policy of social inclusion limiting visitor numbers per household to 20 days per year, and I really think that I don't know how that got onto your framework except that it already exists in North Sydney, which I don't think should be really a criteria for us. The last reason that we need a permit with the address on it is to address the other issues such as the man in the front row has raised, the trades person permit that you are proposing will not work, and it needs to be taken off the framework absolutely. I will take you task on the work zone, I understand where it is coming from, the majority of renovations in homes, I am a home renovator, I am currently doing my 12th renovation. No renovation I have ever done has been done in three weeks, and most of the renovations that I have done in the last five years do not require a DA. I am not entitled to get a work zone.

An internal bathroom for example would take between 16, depending on your tradies, you might get it done in 6 weeks, but many of them are 16 to 20 weeks. That involves a visit first from your designer, then your builder, yeah. Then your plumber for waterproofing. Then you are roughing in, and then you are tiler, then your painter, then your silicone, then your plumber to come back to fit off, two days, and three days at a time. Trades person permits will not work for that situation, because once it is a week, we will park there of that you are proposing. So a person comes for two days, you have used one of your weeks. It's absolutely unworkable, give us a permit with our residential address on it, that is a floating permit, as most of us live in Ocean Beach do right now, it works for support workers, it works for carers, it works for visitors, it works for the extra adult child who has a car, it works for our country visitors, it works for kids coming to have their chemo, you cannot take this away from residents. Please do not use the sledgehammer. I support the Isthmus people, but please be careful what you wish for. Do not support this framework, read it carefully, it is not just about limiting permit numbers, it is about doing a whole lot of other stuff that if you unwittingly support this framework you will have a whole lot of problems that you do not envisage, read this very, very carefully.

Michelle Carter: Thank you. I guess the takeaway from your comments and also yours relating to extending building through this engagement process, that's when we have this opportunity to hear from you to say that doesn't work. I think the tradies will work for some people with a short tradee trip, but then if you do have what you say, that extended home renovation that falls outside of the work zone, we'll need to do some thinking as to how we can have an option perhaps to support that. Whether that is possible to do.

Audience: Everybody is getting something done. Someone has someone, their washing machine is not working. Come on. Why the hell are you putting this pressure on the people, we've got better things to do, live our life, we don't need extra rubbish like this honestly - Contract issue is just bizarre. Having to go to council with your written contract, who gets a written contract when you're only going to fix ... Who gets a written contract to get the plumber to come out and fix their leaking toilet? I do not know where that come from, it is ridiculous

Michelle Carter: We will take that on-board throughout the process.

Audience: You are never going to know when your washing machine is going to break down in the middle of the night, or your fridge.

Michelle Carter: I know.

Audience: Come on. Get rid of it.

Audience (Speaker Eleven): I live in the Ivanhoe area, and now I do not have any problems with parking. I was also going to ask the one about providing a quote for work, because I have a spare permit at the moment, which I see how long the guy is taking with the job, and then if he needs it, we'll put it on his car, and that's what all of us do, and you don't know in advance. My whole electricity fell out a few years ago, I had to get it reconnected from the street, but I mean that involved huge trucks and everything as well, that was I think before we even had the permit scheme. It is not going to work in most cases where you have to have it in advance, unpredicted things, or for things, you do not know how long they are going to take, the moment you just put your spare permit on their car, if they are there for more than two hours. The other thing I noticed was you talking about the permits going until 10:00 PM, currently we have 8:00 PM until 6:00 PM in Ivanhoe, and we have had that. I can remember being at a precinct meeting and we decided 6:00 PM was better for us, and that is what we prefer. Are you going to leave it at 8:00 PM to 6:00 PM up there?

Michelle Carter: Well when we go into the next stage of the project we may actually look at the scheme areas, we'll engage with people living within that precinct, or that scheme area and if it's already through to 8:00 PM or 6:00 PM at night, and we'll work with you, and if that's what works we're happy to keep that in place. But there are some that finish at 10:00 PM, and are the ones that could be reduced down to 8:00. Therefore, we will work within the schemes to get the best outcome.

Audience: Because we do not really need, ours increased. The reason we went into the scheme in the first place was because people were parking further and further away from the wharf, and as far as like, I think, Quinton Road, which I think that's too far up the hill; but they were parking in the lower parts of Quinton Road for instance, so I was seeing people then catching the 142 bus up the hill to get home. So we have really just wanted to stop commuters from parking there.

Michelle Carter: No, I understand. Thank you.

Audience: And we do not have a problem there now.

Michelle Carter: Okay.

Audience: And then number of permits being more than the number of spaces is like a lot of us have a third, extra permit, just for the tradesman, just for the occasional visitor that we hardly ever use, so that is really not an indication of how many cars there are going to be on the street every night.

Michelle Carter: I think that third permit, a lot of people have it for the same reasons that you've mentioned, for that flexibility; but it's also that third permit that can end up on the Black Market, and we think that needs to be managed a little bit better.

Audience: If you put the address on it, then you have solved the problem. The amount that the man said you have to pay for those stickers, I come from a poor background that is ridiculous. Therefore, if you are going to do that, because I think everybody in this room has a spare sticker for that situation where a tradie can use it, a friend can use it, it is essential to most people. Most people do not abuse that. Put the address on the spare sticker and if we have to pay for it, fine; but do not discriminate against people about parking, and do not discriminate against by saying they could end up on the Black Market. They will not end up on the Black Market if they have an address. Simple, very simple for a printer to do that. With computer printing, I will come and tell your print person how to do it if you wish; but it is not \$47. What a sticker? 20 cents? No, I mean you know that is ridiculous. You put the program up, buy the stickers. So there's no difference between adding a list of addresses, you can put that in, it's whatever you want, and then that

sticker can be qualified to that address. That is a simple answer to many of these people's problems. I cannot see why it has not been put on the table.

Audience (Speaker Twelve): I just want to say one thing, will the ideas that have been presented by people, including yourself; will they be presented to the Council? Because I think, that is essential. I mean I know you are not in a position to give us answers, but will our points be considered?

Michelle Carter: Through the formal minutes they will be noted, we will provide some responses within the minutes as well, but what we'll be presenting to council for adoption will be the framework based on the RMS guidelines as to what we can do, and going back to why these.

Audience: You can bring those RMS guidelines. I am sorry, but the RMS guidelines do not actually allow you to do any scheme. You know that don't you? Their guidelines say there is no facility for consumer schemes, parking schemes. So keep that in mind.

Michelle Carter: Okay. Thank you.

Audience (Speaker Thirteen): Hi, I'm actually here for where I work, in a local business, and our three directors own the business and we have one car registered to that business and I just want to ask the question, in the past we've been able to purchase up to five for 20 staff members working there for an area, sorry three this year I think it was, not five. Extra parking because we have sales guys who are in the area, and it is only in business hours. Is that, those people who require to have their cars at work, they are now asking me, "Where are we supposed to park?" I know there is car parking, but it is not feasible because they are in an add-on, different days. They pay, their cars are not going to be registered to the business, and so does that mean that only one car can be registered in the business and their business name to be able to have a permit?

Michelle Carter: That is correct. That is what we are proposing within the framework just to restrict that to one permit per business.

Audience: Right, okay. Thank you.

Audience (Speaker Fourteen): Yeah, my question is, is there any plans to increase the size of the residential parking areas, or decrease the size in any of the areas?

Michelle Carter: Look, potentially there is opportunity to expand into different streets, but any new streets that come into a parking permit scheme area, whether that is an extension of an existing Manly one, or anywhere else across the Northern Beaches will need to 100% comply with the new guidelines and go through the traffic committee formal approval process. There's an opportunity maybe to reduce the scheme areas in some, if there's no need for them to be there, which I think that would be highly unlikely from the information that we've gathered and information from what we're hearing from people here today; but there could be the opportunity to include new streets, but they would all have to meet the eligibility for that. We've heard from people just off the Ivanhoe Park scheme areas, up on the top hill here, that they are impacted by people; because they're just on the outskirts. It is something that we will look at.

Audience: Yeah, that is where I come from. I just know that the lady was talking about Quinton Street, and the vehicles that used to park there are obviously parking in our street, but we're right on the edge, down on Arthur Street. I have noticed over the years that the actual residential parking scheme has gradually increased down Berkeley Road and Quinton, and down to the other side of Francis Street.

Michelle Carter: Yeah, there has been a couple of extensions.

Audience: I've noticed, I sit out on my sun deck on the morning having breakfast, and I notice all the commuters, I see them, they all arrive in the street, pick their times, park there, and off they go for the day. Then if I have a visitor coming during the day then they cannot park anywhere. On the weekend, there is literally no spots to park, on Saturday or Sunday, which quite annoying. I cannot have visitors come to visit me, because there is no parking. They do not have a ... Which is quite frustrating for me, and I mean at one stage that I was considering leaving the area because of the parking. I mean it is ridiculous. I have lived here all my life, and here I am considering leaving the place because parking, you cannot park your car. I only have one car, I am not like a lot of other people that have four or five cars, which I think is an issue. I mean at the moment there's four cars parked from one end, from the end of the street down in front of my property, four cars. They have been there for about three or four weeks, have not moved. All right? So they are using it, they have gone somewhere and they are a family with multiple cars and they have just parked them there and left them there. I mean that's really, to me ... I don't know what the answers are, I don't envy you, the job of actually trying to sort this out, because obviously there's so many issues to sort out.

Michelle Carter: Yeah, I think if your street wouldn't qualify, or if the properties in that street wouldn't fit in with the guidelines for a permit scheme, it's possible we could look at parking restrictions in the street, whether it's a 2P, or a 4P, or an 8P, Monday to Sunday, but then we'd have to really get support of everyone in the street, and that could help; but then it just keeps going and where do we stop in terms of the parking restrictions? But that's something we can definitely look at as well is whether your street would benefit from a 2 hour parking, or a four hour to stop that all day garaging of vehicles; which isn't a pleasant thing to have. Especially when you cannot have, people come and visit.

Audience: Fair enough. Yeah, as I said I do not envy you, because I mean these people, some of them are obviously residents, but it just makes it extremely difficult for other residents as well. Thank you.

Michelle Carter: Thank you. Look, we are right on 11:00 AM, we are happy to keep asking a few more questions, and we are definitely more than happy to speak to people after as well. So perhaps we will just see if there is any more interest from the floor for questions. Yeah, you still have a number, yeah. Thank you.

Audience (Speaker Fifteen): Yes, I live in Manly and we've been here for quite a lot of years, I don't know how the survey was taken, we have a driveway, which should not count as park, because it's a driveway down someone else's space. We are carers for our grandson regularly, we are elderly now, and we have difficulty getting from our car space up the stairs, or even up the very steep drive, so we need to park regularly on the street. We have two parking permits, and two cars. I have just retired from teaching so I needed a car, I think it is unfair the whole plan for our parking permits and I agree with the woman over here, I came to a previous meeting and spoke to someone about putting the number plate and the address on the parking permits. I hardly agree with that I think that's the answer to the whole problem, because we live near, within walking distance to the ferry, we regularly have people park, have a permit from God knows where, out come the suitcases, off they trundle, two weeks, three months one time, it's just not fair. We paid a premium for properties with parking, we've lived there for a long time, and we don't think it's fair, like that person there, that we should have to consider moving away from where we've lived for a long time because of a council deciding on some plan for people, mostly it seems to me for people who don't have any parking, and are going to park on the street, and the rest of us, God knows what, and the poor lady here who can't open a car door, I mean honestly I don't know how the survey was taken, but it wasn't taken very well. Thank you.

Michelle Carter: Do we have more questions?

Audience (Speaker Sixteen): I just wanted to ask, is there any other way, other than linking it to the address that is on the registration. In the building we are in, quite a few people use it periodically use a unit periodically, or they have friends that come and stay. Obviously, their registration is not going to be linked to that address, but I have noticed many people were saying is it possible to get the address, or even a division, a ward, an area, where it can be on the parking permit so you are allowed to park in that area, rather than being linked to the address?

Michelle Carter: That is something that we will take on board during the engagement period, and review that and see if that is a possibility. A few people have mentioned the address on the permit, we need to, I guess all I can say is, take that on board and see if that will be supported within the framework.

Phil Devon: One of the issues with putting an address on a permit that is on a vehicle is the security issue, okay. If they know where the car is, they know which house to break into to get keys. Okay? That was one of the main concerns.

Audience: Thanks. Phil I am not going to give up on this, right? Comments came all through the discussion about not being able to open the car door; you have come up with 1,163 off street parking in Ocean Beach. Tell us how you came up with that number. Did you go onto the properties and physically measure the dimensions of each property? Because there is not many new DAs, the majority of the properties would be 100 plus years old, cars were smaller, cars were fewer, and how did you come up with that number? Tell us how you came up with that number. Did you go onto the properties and physically measure the dimensions of each property? Because there is not many new DAs, the majority of the properties would be 100 plus years old, cars were smaller, cars were fewer, and how did you come up with that number?

Phil Devon: Okay. Under the Australian Standard, there is a given dimension for a car space, okay? Where it's a driveway, if that met that dimension, that was counted as one, a garage that wasn't able to take a B-99 vehicle under the Australian Standard was counted as zero, if it took a B-99 vehicle it put one.

Audience: You are dodging the question, how did you come up with the number? Did you go onto each property? Did you do it via satellite? How did you do it?

Phil Devon: We did it via walking the streets, checking the DAs-

Audience: My DA for that section is 100 years old.

Phil Devon: Yeah.

Audience: I refuse to believe that you looked at the document-

Phil Devon: The newer ones from the –

Audience: Forget the newer ones, because the majority of people here have the same issue. We cannot open a door in certain sections of the driveway.

Phil Devon: Yeah, and that's why –

Audience: I am in Ocean Beach, so you have counted me as either two, three, or four in that 1,163. I want to know how you came to that number. Did you walk on my property? Did you use a tape measure? What did you use?

Phil Devon: We have done a visual inspection.

Audience: You had a guess.

Phil Devon: An educated guess.

Audience: Did you have a guess?

Phil Devon: Yeah, an educated guess.

Audience: Right. Okay.

Phil Devon: Based on the fact...

Audience: Now we are getting somewhere. Thank you for finally answering the question. It is a guess, and the guess is wrong, isn't it?

Phil Devon: No, it is not.

Audience: It has to be wrong. This poor woman has been counted as having a car space, and she cannot get out of her car.

Phil Devon: I do not know whether we have actually counted her driveway

Audience: Of course, you do not because you have guessed it.

Phil Devon: We can go into individual addresses in the spreadsheet, and I will be able to tell you which ones were counted.

Audience: Send us the spreadsheet, let us get into this; because can't you understand what you are doing. This is bureaucracy gone mad. The more issues you people create, the more bureaucrats you get working here, and the more we have to pay. Right? Can't you see what is happening here? You are going to get a revolt, this is divisive policy. Please take this back and do something about it.

Phil Devon: We are taking it on-board.

Audience: So how do we find out if our driveway has been counted?

Audience: He is going to send us the spreadsheet.

Michelle Carter: So it was a walk-by, we did walk through every street and we did a visual check for each property. I did not go out with a tape measure to do that, we did not enter private dwellings, we did go into strata blocks and count within a strata unit block type thing, but we did not enter into a private dwelling

property to do that. It's initial stage audit. We have some good data from it; there is a lot that we do need to further investigate, some of the security blocks we could not get into.

Audience: Your policy is made based on what you have had a guess at. Let me say that again, please record this. Your policy is based on something you have had a guess at. We are effected by your guesses. Who knows if you were smoking a cigarette or having a coffee when you walked passed these people's houses.

Audience: Just recently, we paid what is involved in paying the council fees to get a cross curve crossing on our property. If you walk passed our property I would be \$100 that you have said we have a car parking space, we used DA from about 1947 that had never been signed off by this council, and we never got a construction certificate on the property. Through a loophole, we were able to get a path crossing. Don't recommend it to other people, but if it's there it's great because it means we can get a motor bike up, I can get my little Fiat 500 up next to the house, that's great, it's not a parking spot; but if you went passed our property and looked at it, and looked at our car parking you would say, "Yes, that's a car parking spot," because it really does look visually like it is one. So that is just one example, of two things. One a spot that probably isn't a spot, that would have been counted as one; but also of somebody who's just spent a fair bit of money in doing that so that I can get my little Fiat 500 off the road sometimes when my son comes so I can give him my pass. So I have done that to help work within the current system, and I have about to be penalized for that. So just for those two example, I had thought I would just raise that.

Michelle Carter: Thank you.

Audience: What I do not think you are also respecting here is that our properties were developed, many of them under the heritage issues and heritage guidelines of Manly Council. Some of the stuff we wanted to do to modernize the properties we just were not allowed because of the heritage issues that the former Manly Council had in place. Now as far as I know there are still heritage issues adopted by northern beaches council and that has continued on, and will continue because I have a close eye with that change of the LAPs and the DCPs et cetera. The other thing, please in your presentation take Greater Manly's Residents Forum Office as part of the thing that you consulted with, because you absolutely did not. Thank you.

Michelle Carter: Okay, thank you everyone for coming today. Just ask any further questions before we recap and just talk about next steps. I think yeah, there has been a few consistent things coming through. There is a lot for us to take on-board, there is many conversations, I am more than happy if you stay after and we can talk more about the points that you raised; and we will ensure that those responses are captured as well. I guess what we are trying to work towards is a fair and equitable approach to parking management, and we are referring to the RMS parking permit guidelines through this approach, because that is what we have to work with. With the residential parking permit schemes, they are administered by the guidelines that are in place by the Rose and Maritime Services. So, that is that we are working to. I understand that what has happened in the Manly area has been what has happened; you have all been able to get three permits with no recognition of on street spaces. What we're doing is looking at that now to see if that continues to be the right fit for the local area in line with the guidelines. We have people that do not have off street parking, who cannot find a park near their homes. We have a number of permits of there that we need to look at and see how we can reduce that number of permits. So we are trying to do that the best that we can. We are listening to your feedback, and I think it is just really important to note that we are limited as to what we can and cannot do through the RMS, in terms of how these schemes are managed. That is what we are working towards, and within our still look at the scheme, by the RMS. So I am just being up front and honest with you and that is what we are working towards. That is what the instructions being given to us with this project, so it is a difficult project as well. It is just based on the

history that has been in place with what former Manly Council administered with the permit scheme. So we are working towards hopefully a better outcome, but we need the community input to do that. We have heard a lot from you today, we have taken away many comments, and I really encourage you to put in a written submission as well. Something through the You Say Page just so we can capture those comments again, and consider them. Also, acknowledge as well Manly is an old area, it has been raised that homes are 100 years old, and parking would not have been built for vehicles back then. Therefore, we need to own that and acknowledge that and work with those property owners the best that we can to ensure that they have a fair and equitable opportunity to park on their street. So I would like to thank you, we will get these minutes and the video up on the Your Say Page as soon as we can. We have not yet got Saturday's up, it is probably nearly ready to be loaded. So you can view what happened on Saturday and we will get the minutes published as well. As I said, we do have a number of staff here today, we have the Rangers if you want to talk about any of the parking rules, and we have two of our traffic engineers here today. I am still here and Phil's here that we can talk to you if you have anything further that you want raised.

Phil Devon: Thank you.

Meeting Close – 11.32am