

MINUTES

NORTHERN BEACHES COUNCIL MANLY PARKING PERMIT ENGAGEMENT SESSION

held at Manly Town Hall on

SATURDAY 7 SEPTEMBER 2019

Minutes of the Northern Beaches Council Manly Parking Permit Engagement Session held on Saturday 7 September 2019

At Manly Town Hall

Commencing at 9am

ATTENDANCE:

Emily Carson	Manager – Community Transport & Parking Operations
James Brocklebank	Engineer – Traffic (South Area)
Claudia Brodtke	Minute Taker
Phillip Devon	Manager – Transport Network
Lisa Trewin	Community Engagement Officer
Michelle Berridge	Customer Service Manager
Michelle Carter	Strategic Transport Coordinator
Patrick Bastawrous	Traffic Engineering Coordinator
Scott Taylor	Ranger Coordinator

Meeting Start Time: 9.00am

Michelle Carter – Welcome everybody. Thank you very much for coming today. My name is Michelle and I am the Project Officer working on this project for Council. Before we get started, I would like to acknowledge the traditional owners and the country on which we gather here today. If you have not been into this building before, the bathrooms are situated just out in the hallway and if there is an emergency, we will evacuate the building and muster in the Corso outside St Matthews Church.

We are here today to give you some background information on the proposed framework and to provide you with an opportunity to ask questions as well. There are many questions coming through from the community, so we want to be able to provide an opportunity to come and talk to Council staff.

We are filming today but we are not having any facial recognition; we are just filming the voice and we are filming the presentation, and this will go up on our website so that everyone can view all the information. We will film today; we will film the Tuesday session and we will film Wednesday's session as well.

**MINUTES OF NORTHERN BEACHES COUNCIL MANLY PARKING PERMIT ENGAGEMENT
SESSION
SATURDAY 7 SEPTEMBER 2019**

We have many staff working here today; Claudia is our formal minute taker, so the minutes of today's session will go up on our website along with all the minutes from the sessions on Tuesday and Wednesday as well. We have Patrick who is our Engineering Coordinator and he knows these RMS schemes very well. We have James in the back here as well; James is the Manly Ward Traffic Engineer. Phil Devon, he is our Manager of the Transport Network Team and we have members from our Community Engagement, Parking Operations, Customer Service and Ranger teams in attendance.

You would have taken a number if you wish to ask a question, so what we will go through the presentation and then we will have the opportunity for you to ask a question based on the numbering that you have. If you do not have a number, put your hand up and we will give you a number, and if once, we have gone through the questions, if you would like to ask another one we will give you another number. It is just to ensure that we have a fair process for everyone wanting to ask a question. What we will do, we are here to provide you with information, and we ask that you respect the Council staff working here today and we will show you that same respect. I will hand you over to Phil Devon and he will start the presentation.

Phil Devon - Morning, everyone. We were endorsed at the August Council Meeting to continue with the project and put the Northern Beaches Parking Permit Scheme framework on public exhibition. The framework addresses the RMS requirements for any new schemes that Council bring in - the current Manly scheme is the only one in the Northern Beaches that is in place. The Draft Framework applies to the new scheme, and its application to the Manly scheme is that we are working towards a compliant system – it will not be forced to be compliant from day One. It is a staged approach, 2020, 2021 and so on, as we bring it in.

We are getting many questions about Recommendation F from the Council meeting. It confirms that we are not bringing the full framework into the Manly scheme straight off. It is a staged approach; we are linking the cars to the property addresses at this point

So, for the Engagement snapshot - we had four stakeholder meetings; Manly Business Chamber, the Manly Resident Group, Manly Community Forum and the Greater Manly Resident Forum. We received 94 online comments, 68 written submissions, nine online questions; we had over 340 people that came to five drop-in sessions. That was probably the second highest engagement we have done as a team so far. All the details of that stage of engagement is in the Community Engagement Report we have attached to the Council Report from August.

So, what we heard from that Stage 1 Engagement. There are many permits, which are being sold illegally or rented. I know for a couple of instances where permits are actually for lease on website on a monthly basis, which is taking away parking from genuine residents - so the other thing people wanted us to do was to tighten the permit eligibility so that those who have a genuine need for a permit i.e. the residents get a permit. Those that get permits to resell them and profit from them – that is the issue and residents want to improve enforcement. They want priority given to the residents over businesses and commuters, that sort of thing, people who are probably not using them for the purposes that they were designed for in the first place.

**MINUTES OF NORTHERN BEACHES COUNCIL MANLY PARKING PERMIT ENGAGEMENT
SESSION
SATURDAY 7 SEPTEMBER 2019**

Parking design - so line marking bays, that sort of thing to maximize the parking. In addition, we had feedback on the scheme boundaries as well. Visitor and tradesperson parking were another key theme and the business permits- the intent of the scheme was never for businesses to have residential permits - so that's one thing that we need to address as well.

This (*referring to Presentation*) is a snapshot of the audit that we have undertaken to date - this is the high-level summary. We have broken it down into the streets as well - so we know where the parking is available, where the permits are - 11,500 permits for 3,500 on-street spaces. It is one of the reasons why it is an issue.

Phil Devon – So based on the information that we heard from the earlier engagements - we had the Drop-In Sessions and we had the opportunity for the written comments - we heard a lot, about how you would like the scheme to work. The Framework is in line with the RMS guidelines and what we heard from the community.

The recommendations include the eligibility for permits - so ensuring that people that live in the area (that rent, or are property owners and live in their property) are able to have permits for the house, which they live in - so permits are not available for people who live outside of the area, who are not residents of Manly.

We heard as well that you would like to see the vehicle linked to the permit, because what is happening now, is that there is no vehicle registration number on the permit and that permit can end up anywhere e.g. sold on Facebook. Actually printing the registration number on the permit will limit the opportunity for other people to sell the permit or to use that permit - the vehicle must be, we are asking for it, to be registered to the property and for the person to be living within the property himself or herself.

There are reduced permits per rateable dwelling - so now there are three permits available per property or per business. In line with the RMS guidelines, we are proposing to bring that down to two permits per property to ensure an even spread of permits and parking availability for everyone.

We are bringing in changes to the business permit parking as well. Currently all the businesses that are in the Manly scheme area can apply for three permits and this is taking away really valuable parking for the residents, and also the support of the businesses in the area as well - customers can't park because of the number of businesses who have permits and park on the street during the day and the night.

We've also got a range of permits coming in as well - so we heard from the community that it's really important to have your visitors come over, you have people coming over to do work on your house, there's carers and there's support workers - so we've introduced a range of permits that will accommodate for the needs of people living in the community.

The permit type - we have the residential parking permit, so these schemes are put in place to provide parking to residents with no or limited off street parking and that is the intent of the scheme. We heard from many people that it is difficult to park near your house, just due to the large number of permits out in the market and because some

**MINUTES OF NORTHERN BEACHES COUNCIL MANLY PARKING PERMIT ENGAGEMENT
SESSION
SATURDAY 7 SEPTEMBER 2019**

people do not have off street parking - and that's why these schemes are put in place by the RMS.

The visitor permit – we are coming in with a trial for this and we will have to have a look and see how this will work and how the people living in the Manly area use it. So the visitor permit will be based on a scheme similar to North Sydney Council and City of Sydney Council where it is a one-day scratchy card style and you scratch off the day, the month and the year, and then that card is displayed within the vehicle dashboard. We have some samples that we will put out at the end that we can show you, to demonstrate as to how that will look.

The business permits. So yes, there will still be an opportunity for businesses to have the opportunity to purchase a permit, but they will be for businesses that actually require it to operate their business e.g. if it is the Dive Shop down the road that needs that vehicle to perform their business. If it is registered in the business name and used for that business, they can be eligible for one permit.

Support workers as well - support workers and carers are a valuable, important service to the community. So, support workers - that's registered vehicles to the agency, will be eligible to apply and there's also an opportunity if you're an independent worker that provides support that you also could get a support worker permit as well. Carers are catered for as well – we have many older people living in our community - so there is an option there for the carer who is providing the care to the person in the home to have a permit that is shared between the care workers.

Car share - I think we heard from many people that car share is an important part of the transport mix in the Manly area. For car share, they can purchase permits as well and for the moment, the car-share cars float within a scheme area - so they will still have an opportunity to purchase a permit for their car share vehicle. We do not want to see this service taken away from Manly, so we need to ensure that this continues because it helps with reduction of vehicle ownership and you do not need to buy a car if you have a good car share provider in the area. It really helps with parking demand, parking reduction and car dependency.

The organization permits - what has happened over many, many years is that a number of clubs, charities and schools in the Manly area that have been issued permit - and what we need to do as a Council is to go through all of these and determine which are still necessary for that service - so should we give them to the Sailing Club, the Yacht Club, the Bowling Club? We will be taking steps to engage with all of those organizations to determine what permits they do need - a lot of them provide volunteer services too, for example, the Yacht Club provides Sail-Ability - so they have a valuable part in our community and we want to continue that - but it's making sure they get permits to service that need.

Phil Devon - Council also endorsed the fees and charges to put on exhibition - a lot of the feedback that we had was that it's a cash grab. Bottom line is the \$47 for the first permit does not even cover the cost of producing the permit. We have provided a discount for pensioners, acknowledging that it is at a cost.

**MINUTES OF NORTHERN BEACHES COUNCIL MANLY PARKING PERMIT ENGAGEMENT
SESSION
SATURDAY 7 SEPTEMBER 2019**

Traders permits is one option - so say if you're having a renovation done and it's going to be more than a week or two week's sort of thing - the cheaper option would be a Work Zone - because it's dedicated parking for that site; they're not floating around the scheme areas trying to find somewhere to park. The guidelines for a tradesperson's permit are more that somebody's coming to fix a window or they're going to be there for up to a day or two doing minor work - It's not a renovation per se.

One thing that we have found also is that securely posting the permits now is costing Council significant funds because it is being done by registered mail –so we are recouping the cost there. The carer's permits, as defined in the Act, is how we are going to be issuing those – and obviously, it is a reduced rate for a pensioner. The visitor's permits will be sold in fives or tens on the basis that if you are coming in midway, you might get five or you might get ten depending on where you come into the cycle of the permit. One of the other options that we are looking at is still keeping a third permit, however it would have to meet eligibility requirements as defined - so if the vehicle is registered at that address like I know I've got an eighteen-year-old at home, his car would be registered to that address, your kids cars are registered to that address so you'd have up to three anyway.

Audience: Can I ask a question? What if you have more than two cars?

Phil Devon: Can we just hold all the questions to the end? Just so, we can run through this and give everyone an opportunity

Michelle Carter: I know there is many questions that people have, so we only have a couple more slides to go through - do you have a number - have you been allocated one?

Audience member confirms that they have a number.

Michelle Carter: So next step, where do we go from today? So, we have today, we have next Tuesday, and we have Wednesday as well. The engagement period is open until the 29th of September - so you have all this opportunity to talk to us today, put in an online submission about what you think of the framework and if you propose any changes ... bearing in mind that we do need to work towards the RMS guidelines as well - so I really encourage you to read those so you have an understanding of how they work and sort of think about what we could improve within the framework.

We have undertaken internal engagement as well, so we are talking with our Rangers and providing them the opportunity to go through the framework and see how that will help them in their role. They are out there walking the streets every day in Manly, so they know the areas well and they know the issues. We have two rangers here today as well that will be able to help you - they are out there on the ground, day in and day out.

We are doing internal engagement with our Customer Service team. Customer Service will be the ones that will be issuing you the permits, they will be going through the application process and they will be the ones determining the eligibility based on the information you provide to us. We have got Parking Operations as well, they come in, play a part - we're doing internal engagement with them as well as the community to

**MINUTES OF NORTHERN BEACHES COUNCIL MANLY PARKING PERMIT ENGAGEMENT
SESSION
SATURDAY 7 SEPTEMBER 2019**

make sure that we get the framework right and that we have a system that works for Northern Beaches Council and also for the residents of the Northern Beaches.

So what we do following the closing of the engagement period – is we go through the submissions, we consider everything and then if necessary we'll go through and consider what changes we can make and go through an internal discussion on that as well as to what we will do. We will talk with the RMS as well on the framework before we take it back to Council. We are aiming hopefully around November, but we will say late 2019 for formal adoption. That will take place at a Council meeting, as what you would have seen when the framework was endorsed, and the Council will decide to adopt the framework.

What we are proposing to do if we do seek adoption, we will propose to implement the scheme from the first of February next year. So that will start with Little Manly, that will be the first scheme area to go through the new eligibility and the new application process and then as each scheme renews, we will bring each scheme into line with the new framework that we will have adopted.

I am sure you are all familiar with the Your Say page, so you have all been on there and you all know how that works. Just from the first stage of engagement, to this one, we have moved to a different page so it might look a little bit different - it is a new platform that Council is using, so just take some time to get familiar with it and find where all the documents are. Please follow the project as well. We've got a whole heap of iPads here today and if you really want to know more about the Your Say page or follow the project, go and see a staff member and we'll go through and show you where the page is and how you can follow the project. You can make a submission through the Your Say page or you can formally write to Council as well.

If you want to know more and if you want to hear all this again, please come back on Tuesday or Wednesday. We will be here going through exactly the same presentation and it will all be online as well, and we have the online Q&A session as well, so there's been quite a few questions asked already and we're working as fast as we can to get responses. We thought we had caught up and then I checked again yesterday and there are heaps more that are coming through. So many questions coming from the community online, but just bear with us, please just give us time to review them and respond to those.

There's a lot of related documentation as well that we've been referring to today, so all that information is available on the website so there's a link to the RMS parking permit guidelines. There is also the draft framework as well that is online and there is copies here today of both of those documents. There is the agenda for the Council meeting that was held in August and the Minutes as well; if you wanted to read through in detail those, they are available. We have the full Community Engagement Report from Stage One with every single comment that came through, all the written submissions, all the submissions that came through Your Say, all the ... I don't know how many people here today came along to the sessions that were held downstairs, where we had an information gathering sort of system where we had all the sticky notes and all those comments were typed up and captured as well. We've compiled all that information into one document so everyone can read what everyone else has been saying about the project.

**MINUTES OF NORTHERN BEACHES COUNCIL MANLY PARKING PERMIT ENGAGEMENT
SESSION
SATURDAY 7 SEPTEMBER 2019**

Okay, that is pretty much all our talking because we know there is a lot of interest from the community in this project, so we wanted to allow enough time for you to also ask questions of staff. It is only 20 past nine now, so we are proposing to finish at 10:00, so what we can do is start to take questions from the floor. Our staff will go through and provide you with a microphone - because we have many interesting questions, we will do two minutes per question just so we can get through everything. We may go over, if you need to leave at 10:00 please do so. We want everyone to have an opportunity to be heard today and to have his or her questions answered which we are why are keeping it to two minutes, which is our formal Council meeting process as well. We will hand it over to question number one.

Audience (Speaker One): I am a local resident in the Manly area around the Fairy Bower area. Having read the Draft Policy earlier this week, I noticed that it has proposed to limit households to two eligible permits. My family is not much different to many families; we have four adults living in our house. I am not sure what I am going to tell my two adult children who I will be no doubt supporting for another five years at least, "Sorry, you're not going to be able to park." I mean it is just ridiculous. I have no hesitation coming up with a scheme that tries to limit the raughting of the scheme- you can put them in jail for all I care - but to take it out on honest, local residents by limiting it to two permits, it is ridiculous, absolutely ridiculous. I do not know who came up with the idea of the magic number two and if I read the policy carefully, if you have a lockup garage that number comes down to one.

Michelle Carter: It does, that is right. These are, I guess, guidelines in place by state government through the RMS and I've only-

Audience: They are guidelines.

Michelle Carter: They are mandatory guidelines. What we are dealing with is an area that has high parking demand. We will do our best to implement a scheme that can accommodate up to three, potentially there is an option for a third per household - but yes, the off-street parking does come into that. We will take that question on notice; it has been minuted. All the questions are being recorded and they will be available on Your Say. Thank you for asking that, and I think that questions shared by many people. Number two?

Audience (Speaker Two): My name is [REDACTED]; I live in Addison on the Little Manly area. I have attended two of the drop-in sessions and I take it that cars on the car sharing permit are only one person at that ... at the two I attended - it is car share and they were located right in the Central area. My question is why aren't Council staff listening to the needs of the residents and ratepayers? I will start with this week - we are allowed what? 20 visitor spots? I would have used seven this week. I had three guests and I had an overnight stay of four nights. Seven gone out of my 20. Absolutely ridiculous. I would like to suggest how you fix the problem and it is quite simple as far as I can see. You give every ratepayer one visitor parking spot, not attached to a car. They can use that then for their visitor- they can use it for the support worker - giving multiple ones to support workers is absolutely ridiculous. They are all going to be using it over weekends and everything else. The way you stop the on selling is that we as a resident must return that at the end of the year if we want it again the following year. If

**MINUTES OF NORTHERN BEACHES COUNCIL MANLY PARKING PERMIT ENGAGEMENT
SESSION
SATURDAY 7 SEPTEMBER 2019**

you are a landlord, and you want it again, you must do the same, so it is part of the bond that it is returned.

We could use that free one for our tradespeople. Absolutely ridiculous, who knows the date the tradesman is going to turn ... I live in a block of units, my strata manager doesn't. Where did you allow for strata managers? You had to be a resident to do it. What else? Businesses. I think you have done something to address that, so I give you credit for that. Car share put the car shares in the Whistler Street Car Park.

Audience (Speaker Three): Boarding houses, I notice you're providing a permit per bedroom. Now, when these places were approved, we were told that not everybody in that building would require a car. Now you are giving every bedroom a car. Why is that?

Michelle Carter: Patrick – do you want to answer that one regarding the development conditions of boarding houses?

Patrick Bastarous: Boarding houses are by State legislation approved to have half a space per bedroom, which would entitle half the development to a parking space.

Audience: So, with the demand on street, how are you managing the lack of space?

Phil Devon: Part of the problem is if we refuse these applications for boarding houses quite often, they are overturned in Land Environment Court. We had one at French's Forest recently where they were proposing to have a car share scheme on site, but they were expecting a provider to provide a single car for 12 rooms. Which doesn't work.

Audience: You're there to protect the interests of the community, right? You're looking out for all of us. Everybody in a boarding house should not be given a car space – they all spread out on the local area.

Michelle Carter: I think they as well would still need to own a vehicle as well; they all wouldn't get one. So, they'd still need to meet their eligibility and have a vehicle registered to them as well. Yeah.

Audience: But it they've all got a car; we need to address this for us and not just for them.

Audience (Speaker Four): I'd just second that by saying that a boarding house of 10 rooms can get up to 10 permits, but a household with three adult children living at home with kids that are dependent on their cars to get a job and they can't get housing, they can't buy a house, they can't get one per working adult that lives in the home and I think that's active discrimination against families.

My question is, now we've got a system that apart from some areas that are under a lot of pressure near the beaches and on Shelly Hill are working very, very well. We get up to three passes per home. Many of us use that third pass as our floating pass for our visitors and we use it for support workers, for carers, for tradespeople, you name it, we

**MINUTES OF NORTHERN BEACHES COUNCIL MANLY PARKING PERMIT ENGAGEMENT
SESSION
SATURDAY 7 SEPTEMBER 2019**

use it for those people. You only need to do ... And for the past year or more I've been contacting the Council regularly providing information on the profile of people on Facebook, on Gumtree who are selling it for big money and leasing it and I have been repeatedly told by the Council you can't do anything about it.

Which is not actually true, because you have the details of the people and those are meant to be non-transferable, so this Council could have acted previously, and they haven't. Now we are being punished because of that and that is unfair and discriminating. What needs to be done? What you're doing by bringing in these new systems for carers, for support workers, for tradespeople and half the visitor parking. They're more permits, right now we have three, works like a dream for the bulk of the areas. Get rid of the black market, change nothing else, have another look at it in two years' time. I think you'll find it works perfectly.

You're creating an overcomplicated, ridiculous system, particularly when it comes to tradespeople and the visitor parking. The visitor parking idea of 20 passes per year goes directly against your own policy of social inclusion. How can we have, as elderly people, our children to come and stay? How can we have country visitors come?

It will not work. Just because they've got it in North Sydney, please do not punish us for the inadequacies of this Council or the Manly Council. I'm not talking about Northern Beaches; I'm talking about the Old Manly Council who took the rego numbers of our passes. That's what caused the problem. Put them back on. My suggestion. And it's simple, you don't need all of this. Fix the problem then have a look at it. If you still have a problem, okay, come back to us and talk to us again. But if you get the rego numbers on the stickers, give us three stickers as now, attach them to rego numbers. Give us a visitor parker which has got our address on it. We can use that then; it goes nowhere else.

And the other thing is with these visitor parking ideas that you're talking about, that's another black market. I'll tell you right now, so you're putting more cars on our streets by this system than taking them off. Because I can now go and get my three as you said, plus I can get a carer's, plus I can get my tradespeople three weeks a year, plus I can get 20 visitor parking. I've suddenly got more. It's crazy and it is not the solution.

Audience (Speaker Five) - I'm speaking as someone who lives currently in the first street outside of the parking] zone. So, what consideration has Council given to the what these streets, these first street, the streets on the fringe, what they're going to look like once the scheme has been implemented? Because they're going to be inundated with cars.

Michelle Carter - It's possible that they could be. They very well could be. They already are, like a lot of people are parking on the fringes already.

Audience - So you're taking someone else's ... you're taking the property; you're taking someone else's problem and just shifting.

Michelle Carter - It's possible, yeah.

**MINUTES OF NORTHERN BEACHES COUNCIL MANLY PARKING PERMIT ENGAGEMENT
SESSION
SATURDAY 7 SEPTEMBER 2019**

Audience - I appreciate that you've got to draw the line somewhere. But it's not going to ... that's not going to work either. There are a lot of streets which are on the fringe of the various zones, has that been given thought?

Michelle Carter - We have, and as to how that is managed, is it extending the scheme areas to include those streets? Do those homes qualify for a parking permit scheme? Or where, as you say, where do we draw the line? Where's the boundary? It will just keep creeping out.

Audience - It's a bad problem now and it's just going to compound 10 times worse if this scheme is introduced. So again, it's a different, it's a slightly different problem to some of the other issues being raised.

Michelle Carter: Noted, thank you.

Audience (Speaker Six): I live in Ashburner Street which comes in the Isthmus Precinct. One - I have no off-street parking. I think it's unfair and unreasonable that I must pay to park on the street when I have no other option. I mean I would say I think it's unfair that businesses still will be able to access permit parking. You see a change 7:00 AM in the morning of residents leaving for work and businesses coming in, tradespeople, with the amount of building that's going on in Manly. But the businesses coming in with their staff parking, who have obviously got permits. I don't really see why a real estate agent, as you mentioned earlier, needs to have car parking. I've worked in other areas and never been provided staff parking permits. Why should any business other than for the transport of equipment or people be permitted a parking permit in the Isthmus area?

I also think in the block of units that I live in there are 12 units. Not one of them has off street parking, so potentially that's 12 cars that could possibly require parking. And yet there's very few permit parking spaces in the precinct - including on East Esplanade, that's only two-hour parking. I frequently must drive around and must go to Little Manly or another precinct, park for two hours and then must move my car again. With sometimes quite a long walk, it's unfair and unreasonable for the residents in this precinct that businesses are permitted.

Michelle Carter: Yeah, well in the case about the numbers, the business permits would be quite low so it would have to be, as you say, the vehicle registered to the business and used for the purpose of the business. When Isthmus renews, if/when the framework is implemented, I think it's the first of March that Isthmus would renew so you'd notice a really big reduction in permits.

Audience: And another question here, why has that been brought forward? The renewal wasn't due till the end of June.

Michelle Carter: That's a question for Michelle from customer service.

Michelle Berridge: So with the renewal of the parking permits I'm sure many of you are aware that when you apply for your permits you can encounter a great queue when you come into Customer Service because you get several thousand coming due at one

**MINUTES OF NORTHERN BEACHES COUNCIL MANLY PARKING PERMIT ENGAGEMENT
SESSION
SATURDAY 7 SEPTEMBER 2019**

time. What we've tried to do is we're trying to mitigate and make it better so that we are able to more quickly serve you and more fairly distribute the actual permit times throughout the year. So, for instance you look at the end of March, it's huge. And so, we're trying to spread it out a bit to make it better for everybody.

Audience: Still seems like we're being penalized in this precinct, particularly with being charged for the first permit when we have no other option but to park on the street. It's unfair, I don't know what we're paying our rates for.

Michelle Carter: Okay. Okay, we'll move onto question number seven.

Audience (Speaker Seven): Hi, my name is [REDACTED]. I live in the Ocean Beach Precinct. The Council some while ago introduced the beach parking scheme. That resulted in about three of four hundred spaces from the Ocean Beach Precinct being removed from the Ocean Beach Precinct. We've got 785 additional or excess car parking spaces in that precinct, now people come down from further up the peninsula, use Manly as a transport hub. Hop on a ferry, go to the city. You've created the problem yourselves; your own policies are creating these problems. Fix the problems that the Council has introduced. Sort out that sort of problem and then come back to us and look at what needs to be done in the individual precincts. There are micro issues in micro areas, deal with those, don't just completely scrap a scheme that's been already approved by RMS. The problem you have with this scheme is the non-compliance induced by the Council's decision not to implement the eligibility criteria, not to put rego numbers on labels. Fix the maladministration of the Council, not necessarily yourselves, but past Councils. Fix those problems, come back to us and then work it out. Sorry.

Michelle Carter: Thank you. Yeah, good question. So, the beach, you're talking about the 4P on the beach front where the now blue stickers every-

Audience: Yeah.

Michelle Carter: There's 220,000 permits out there of the rate payer ones.

Audience: Sorry. I did a walk along the beach front, counted the number of Northern Beaches stickers occupying the car parking spaces. 70% on Monday between 9:30 and 10:30, 70% were from out of the area, non-Manly people. 9% of them, from memory had local stickers, they were locals in the area. So that's-

Audience: We did the mathematics, that's like 300 spaces. 300 spaces.

Audience: That residents could've been using.

Michelle Carter: Okay, so from my understanding, the car parking spaces on the eastern side facing the surf beach were not part of the parking permit scheme. They weren't signposted so they're not typically onto-

Audience: They had Ocean Beach written on them. If you go and look at them, there's a little sticker over the top of what used to say Ocean Beach Precinct.

MINUTES OF NORTHERN BEACHES COUNCIL MANLY PARKING PERMIT ENGAGEMENT
SESSION
SATURDAY 7 SEPTEMBER 2019

Michelle Carter: Used to, okay.

Audience: There's a little sticker over it that blanks it out.

Audience: The meter required your registration number.

Michelle Carter: Yeah, so that was the old former Manly Beach scheme and now we have the Northern Beaches Beach Permit that has replaced that. And correct, everyone across the Northern Beaches with a sticker can come and park.

Audience: And I hope you know that as residents when we go up, say to Church Point, we've got to pay.

Michelle Carter: You don't have to pay. It's 4P or 8P with a sticker.

Audience: There is a specific thing which they map out all the Northern Beaches residences can park there, except for Saturday and Sunday and public holidays and you've got to pay.

Michelle Carter: It's your permit is valid for 4P or 8P. So that's correct.

Audience: The sign needs to be made clearer.

Michelle Carter: It could be the signage. It should be 4P or 8P – we will investigate this, it's not the intent.

Audience: It leads to the fact that because of the pressure on parking at Palm Beach, there were a couple of areas that eschew the Northern Beaches program and it was communicated at the time it came out. We were told that, "Yes, you could park on any beach on the peninsula. Except a couple of particular areas because of the pressure on it."

Michelle Carter: Yeah, correct. But Saturday, Sunday, public holidays it's 4P or 8P depending on what side of the car park you're on, your sticker's valid for that. You don't need to pay.

Audience: Well, they need to change the stickers then.

Michelle Carter: Yeah, okay. We'll check the wording on that to make sure that that's clear. But it's only the north car park you can't park in, that's Western Foreshore Parking, but the south we'll check the wording. It's been in place nearly 12 months.

Audience: So, is there any car parking on the peninsula where that Northern Beaches Beach Parking sticker doesn't apply?

Michelle Carter: Yes, there are. Church Point car park it doesn't, nor Pittwater Park North nor Boat Trailer Parking areas. We have a large offshore community. Because of the time, and this isn't directly related to the Manly Parking, we will have to stop talking about this.

**MINUTES OF NORTHERN BEACHES COUNCIL MANLY PARKING PERMIT ENGAGEMENT
SESSION
SATURDAY 7 SEPTEMBER 2019**

Audience: Because the fact is, we can't go there and park for an unlimited time, but they can come down here and park.

Michelle Carter: We have managed the parking demand in several ways - putting the parking restriction on the beach sticker, you'll see that coming into Collaroy very soon as well. There'll be the hourly restriction for the beach permit. It's in place in Pittwater Park South for 4P, 8P, weekends and public holidays. So, it's coming soon to Collaroy and it could roll out to other high demand parking beaches as well.

Audience: But it doesn't apply down here yet?

Michelle Carter: 4P on the beach front.

Audience (Speaker Eight): I'm in Addison Road and every house in our block has had to turn their back garden into car spaces. Does that mean if those, if our back gardens now can handle two cars, does it come under the guidelines that we wouldn't be eligible for any parking stickers? Because we've had to give up our garden and because we could never guarantee parking outside our house - so it's just a question I just wondered about, because every house in our block has given up their garden for car spaces.

Phil Devon: At this point, you will not have to give up your permits for those two spaces, okay? Because of the staged rollout you will still get the two permits, or if you've got three vehicles registered, you'll still be able to apply for that third one. Okay?

Audience: For one year? One year?

Phil Devon: Until we review it again. It'll still have to go back to Council for approval at that point. For the review in 2021, it will still have to be reported to Council.

Audience: Okay. Because in the framework, it actually says in '21 we're bringing it in. It doesn't say it's going to be reviewed and that's what's hard to know what we're voting for on this framework. Let's not think about reviews yet. For 2020 yes, but not for 2021.

Michelle Carter: To answer your question, I think we would consider those as off-street spaces. If they're formal spaces, they would be considered as an off-street space and could potentially reduce the number of permits if that, in 2021 when that ... if supported by Council does come in.

Audience: They could put the gardens back.

Michelle Carter: They could, absolutely. Yeah.

Audience (Speaker Nine): I'm just seeking clarification on clause 2.3 quantity of permits. Where it says that, "Two parking permits will be issued per rateable property." What happens in a situation where you have a duplex that's non strata'd or a small block of four units that are non strata'd? Does that mean that they'll only be issued two parking permits for that entire property where you've got residents living in that? And the whole premise of this is to provide a service to those residing in the area. And

**MINUTES OF NORTHERN BEACHES COUNCIL MANLY PARKING PERMIT ENGAGEMENT
SESSION
SATURDAY 7 SEPTEMBER 2019**

clearly if you take it at face value as you've written it here, that would mean that a block of four units where you have two, four two-bedroom units, eight people living, potentially eight cars would only get two? Or not? Well, yeah, if they've got no off-street parking. So, you'd get maximum of two and you've got residents residing in an area where you have restricted the parking in that street, and they can't park. I mean to me ... So, I'm just seeking clarification.

Michelle Carter: I think I know what block you're referring to exactly. But was it built as four two-bedroom units?

Audience: Yes, it was.

Michelle Carter: And it was built some time ago? Like many, many, many years ago?

Audience: Absolutely. There's plenty of them in the Manly area.

Michelle Carter: There are. There's a lot of old, you may not be alone in that case, whether it's formally strata'd or whether it's a community title as well. That is something we'll need take on notice today as to how we will address that. If it was built as four two-bedroom units with no off-street parking, then we will have to have a look at that and note in our system that those properties will be eligible for permits because that was how they were built as the intent. That would be my understanding.

Audience: Okay, great.

Michelle Carter: But we will take that on notice because I don't think you'll be alone. There's a lot of old apartments and it's potentially you could be paying higher rates as well, yeah, for that.

Audience: Well, you are. I mean if you look at the actual rates that are being paid.

Michelle Carter: Yeah, more than a single dwelling would, yeah. We'll work, we'll check with rates on that as well, so we'll do a process to check eligibility so that's, yeah, that has come up. Thank you.

Audience: Thank you

Audience (Speaker Ten): I live in Alexander Street; I've lived there for 50 years and I've seen a lot of changes in Manly. The biggest one was Henry Wong changed it when he brought in the precinct committees and nothing's been ordinary since then or normal. But well, our problem down there is the flooding. If we don't have three permits at all, we get a storm like last Friday night, the road was covered, the water's up past our place in both streets and including Golf Parade, we've got to move our cars regularly just every time you have a storm. They extended the swimming pool; they built the swimming pool up. The Council's at fault in a lot of cases and they've built the swimming pool up, the golf course up, everything else is going up. Now all the houses beside us are going up. What I'd like to know, I'd ask the gentleman there on the seat, how many parking stickers do you sell from the Council over the counter in the Council? How many do you sell per year?

**MINUTES OF NORTHERN BEACHES COUNCIL MANLY PARKING PERMIT ENGAGEMENT
SESSION
SATURDAY 7 SEPTEMBER 2019**

Phil Devon: With the resident stickers, or?

Audience: No. Yeah, resident stickers or to any businesses and everything like that? How much money do you make out of selling tickets, stickers?

Phil Devon: There's 11,500 permits that are being issued.

Audience: Sold. Sold by Council? And sold by Council only?

Phil Devon: The first one's free, so-

Audience: But you can come in off the street and buy them off the Council?

Audience: I've been there where that's been done.

Audience: It's been done. I know people who do it. I know businesspeople who are in Brookvale, used to come into Manly, buy their sticker down here for about three or four grand and then have it for the year.

Michelle Carter: What I'll do, I'll get Michelle from customer service to answer that question for you.

Audience: Thank you very much. Now coming back to the flood problem and the storms. We must move our cars regularly all the time, so we need three stickers and as I say, you're trying to get something out of the Council on a weekday it's hard enough. But if you've got a problem and trying to get a sticker on a weekend you've got no chance in the world. The Rangers are going to be around every Sunday, Saturday, Sunday. So as the gentleman here said on a number of whatever he said, you've got to stick to the old system, and they try and correct it. It's all Council fault. There's no fault of the residents. There's no fault of the residents. Give us the three stickers and let us give them out who we need to visit our place. We've got grandchildren, we like to see them. And this way you're saying I can't see them. You understand why people ... But as I said, most of the people on this committee is probably living up the peninsula and not in Manly and don't understand the Manly situation. We've got these stupid big garbage trucks coming down single lane roads, they must drive up and down Alexander Street, Rolf Street and Golf Parade, reverse down, reverse back, turn around, reverse down then come back again. You're going backwards and forwards, you can't get through the streets because you've got these ... And they still only have the same payload they told me, as what the old trucks have, the smaller trucks.

Michelle Carter: We may have to stop it here as we have a lot more to get through.

Audience: Yeah, right, well I'd like you to take it back to where we were this year and then fix it from there. Fix it there. And if you're only going to look where cars come from, every morning go out the beach front, stand there, there'll be a queue backed up past Harbor Road and then they're up over Queenscliff Road. They're the people that are coming and using our beach front.

**MINUTES OF NORTHERN BEACHES COUNCIL MANLY PARKING PERMIT ENGAGEMENT
SESSION
SATURDAY 7 SEPTEMBER 2019**

Michelle Carter: All right, thank you we're going to move onto the next question now, number 11.

Audience (Speaker Eleven): Thank you. I've lived in Victoria Parade 23 years. I've heard today that all these RMS are guidelines. Council doesn't follow its own guidelines when it comes to planning. There's a building across the road from us that is an old building, number 29 Victoria. It has six old apartments, no off-street parking. Council approved four three bedroom and studies above it to be built on top of it. It exceeds the height limit by eight meters. The building next to us is going up with ... and exceeding 6.5 meters. Not enough parking for the project that's going ahead. You're taking off all the resident parking for people that pay extra for their apartments with an off-street parking. We all have family. I was on the committee for the CBD parking before Henry Wong bought in the parking stickers. I'd been a member of that for a long time, we argued about businesses. Why doesn't Council provide parking for businesses in the basement of the Coles Wentworth Parking? Or in the Isthmus Street? Why should we be having them park on our street, come and car ... Yes, you can get a vehicle registered to the business and the business pays it and it's a tax deduction for the business. So, you're going to end up with problems there. We don't have enough parking, this business of a study or a boarding house thing being only equal ... A study's worth nothing, a boarding house is half. You keep adding more and more apartments to buildings that do not have off street parking and you're not enforcing it. I just feel penalized.

Michelle Carter: Thank you, we'll take that on notice. Thank you.

Audience: I have to go. I only have half an hour parking out there. I pay enough bloody rates, I live in Little Manly, I was born in Manly - it's rubbish, it really is.

Michelle Carter: I just want to thank you. Check in with time, it's five to 10:00 so we are more than happy to take more questions. There's probably at least another 12 people with numbers and then there's more questions. We want to get through all of them. Is everyone happy to stay? We're happy to stay as well.

Audience (Speaker Twelve): Yes, good morning. Good morning. I live in Ocean Beach Precinct and I note most of the precincts have restrictions from 8:00 AM to 6:00 PM. Ocean Beach is 8:00 AM to 10:00 PM and I just want to know what the reason for that is. It technically means we can't have people for dinner, for more than two hours in an evening. Not that I've ever seen a ranger come down at nine o'clock at night, but I just wonder why that precinct has got a late-

Michelle Carter: They all have a 10:00 PM finish. Most of them should have 10:00 PM. Is that the normal? Okay, we'll look at that. There could be some different time restrictions.

Audience: I think most of the precincts are generally 8:00 AM to 6:00 PM.

Michelle Carter: Okay -in the 2P, permit scheme areas, there are some that go to a 10:00 PM.

**MINUTES OF NORTHERN BEACHES COUNCIL MANLY PARKING PERMIT ENGAGEMENT
SESSION
SATURDAY 7 SEPTEMBER 2019**

Audience: I don't see any reason for 10:00 PM at night.

Michelle Carter: Yeah, exactly. That's what we're hearing as well. So, through the next part of the project we will work with each precinct area to look at the timing and does that need to change to 8:00 PM and does that work better? Because then that means you can park from 6:00 PM.

Audience: We can have guests for dinner then.

Michelle Carter: Exactly, that's right. So, do they work? Does 10:00 PM work for people? If not, we're more than happy to look at that and review time restrictions as part of this.

Audience: So, if you are also going to review the number of businesses that have permits there will be more of an opportunity to park?

Michelle Carter: Correct, that's right. There are more overnight parking opportunities if that were the case as well. There's more opportunity to have people over in the evenings for dinner, because the 2P would ... If it's a six o'clock finish you can park from 4:00 PM.

Phil Devon: Particularly if there is a reduced number of permits.

Audience (Speaker Thirteen): Yes, thank you. I get the increasing density in the Manly area; it's going from medium to high. I also understand that parking is going to be a war of sorts inside Council's administration team to try and resolve the problems there. That's a fact. What I do have a problem with is I think that the Council's embarked upon a strategy where they can only lose in every direction they seek to try and finance it. I would encourage Council to resolve the problems by region, rather than trying to adopt a blanket framework. Tower Street car parking area, or region, is a disaster, right? Absolutely, there's no question of that. Sections of Ocean Beach there's not a great deal of problem. What I see a great deal of issue here is that if you adopt a blanket approach across these regions, like the Manly area, and you then neglect Collaroy Plateau, who probably doesn't have a parking spot issue in the whole entire year. Then you're actively doing this discrimination, so if you're going to force everybody within the Manly zone to lose car parking spaces, yet you allow Collaroy Plateau to have known, that would be inconsistent. But I think the inconsistency is the consistent part that you need to adopt. You need to look at Little Manly and go, "You know what? I've got a problem there. I've got a problem at Tower Street, Ocean Beach, part of it is a problem. Are there areas? Isthmus is a real problem." And adopt those strategies that are relating to that area. Clearly 70% of the Northern Beach's parking rights are a key issue in Manly. You've got to resolve that; you've got to resolve the registration. You don't need to introduce a framework that makes all our residents really upset because it's changes and its negative change. You can just fix a few little problems, take stock, go back to consultation in 18 months' time. Maybe the Council will get a gold star for being clever out of this whole thing that the staff does, and we'd all be a lot happier. So why are we embarking on this war of pain when we clearly don't need to?

MINUTES OF NORTHERN BEACHES COUNCIL MANLY PARKING PERMIT ENGAGEMENT
SESSION
SATURDAY 7 SEPTEMBER 2019

Michelle Carter: Thank you. Yeah, why are we doing it? Look, we're coming in to Manly to review the scheme, to ensure that we do work towards the RMS guidelines. Basically, the schemes are tricky to manage and it's hard. We're coming in with an area that has something in place for a long time and that was put in place by former Manly, they allowed it to be what it is today. So, we're coming in with the, I guess, the position to help improve parking for people in Manly. But what we're hearing is that we're not going to do that, we're going to create more worlds of pain and that's not our intent. So, we've got the draft framework out, we're hearing a lot from you today. There's a lot that we're taking away today with feedback as well. So, what we're hearing is the eligibility and the vehicle registrations, you want that to change. But you want us to leave your off street car parking spaces alone, but still have three permits.

Audience: Is it too hard to implement and then review?

Michelle Carter: It's not, no. That's basically what this first year of implementation would look at. So, from the first of Feb next year with Little Manly when we do come in with the two per property and the eligibility and vehicle registration, and not considering the off street, that does allow us to look at exactly what you were saying. And it could be, "Hey, it's actually really good now." We may need to just leave as is.

Audience: Can the framework can be updated, because unfortunately the problem is the framework does not match what you're hearing from the Q&A. And so, people, residents and there's now over 100 people and they're telling me, "We don't know what we're voting for here. We don't know whether we're improving.

Michelle Carter: We won't be able to update it during the exhibition process, but we're taking on everything that you're hearing, and we can revise that to go back to Council for support. What we'll do, we'll just move on. Just so we can hear everyone, we'll move onto the next question, please.

Audience (Speaker Fourteen): We're a young family, we live in Cliff Street. All my points have been covered but just for the minutes, you record them as similar or the same points as question number four and question number one, please.

Michelle Carter: Thank you

Audience (Speaker Fifteen): Yeah, that's me. I live at Little Manly on Wood Street; I've got a two-car garage. I've got a work van that I can't fit in the garage. I've got a daughter who drives, I've got a son who's just about to get his license and I've got a 92-year-old mother who comes up and needs parking. When the new scheme starts, when I get home from work, where do I park?

Michelle Carter: With your work van?

Audience: Yeah, where do I park? Do I get up every two hours and move it? And then wait to 10 o'clock, then wait for the rangers who are here today, to put their input in? I think what you need to do is this lady at the front here in the white (referring to Speaker Two), I think you need to sit down with her and listen to her because she's been 100% correct. That's all you got to do. Do what she says, and everyone will be happy. And I don't even know the lady. Where do I park my van?

MINUTES OF NORTHERN BEACHES COUNCIL MANLY PARKING PERMIT ENGAGEMENT
SESSION
SATURDAY 7 SEPTEMBER 2019

Michelle Carter: Is it possible that vehicle, you work vehicle, could be registered to your property to be eligible for a permit?

Audience: Yes, but I've only got two spots.

Michelle Carter: Two spots.

Audience: We've got a two-car garage, so we can't get one. So, I want to know where I park? Or do I give up work?

Audience: I believe there is no permit to be issued to a truck or trailers?

Michelle Carter: That's correct.

Audience: Mine's a van, mine's a van but it won't fit in my garage. So, what I need to know is where do I park my truck? My van, where do I park it? Do I give up? Just stop work and go on the dole? What do I do? Tell me. And when my mum comes up, where does she park? She must park in the garage. A 38 square meter unit can still get one off the street. But we're in however many square meters we've got, and we can't get one on the street. It's not fair. And how many residents did you sit down with and go through this thing you worked out? You sat down with a couple of the rangers who do a good job.

Michelle Carter: Yes.

Audience: And they're under the most stress, but you need to really sit down with a couple of residents like this lady (referring to Speaker Two) and a couple of other good points and work it out. No one wants more parking. The problem is everyone selling their tickets to give to someone else to give to someone else.

Audience (Speaker Sixteen): I live at Little Manly on a Sunday, as the Ranger Scotty would know, you can't get a parking ticket ... you can't get a park there anytime. But what happens, you got all the people that come from out there, they park there and suddenly they put a residents parking ticket on their thing and they're there for eight hours and then they leave the beach, leave the mess and then they go. And that's what you're leaving us with. So, what you need to do is make it easy for the rangers, because you've asked the rangers for their thing and look after the residents. Sometimes they don't leave, do they? After eight hours – they sometimes sleep in their car. After 10:00, we can't even get a ranger after hours. We even complained, I asked the Council about this and they said, "Oh, that's a bit of a problem, isn't it?" And that's the answer I got because these people are sleeping in their vans, underneath the sign saying, "No Camping." But we can't get a ranger out to fine them because no one's working. I think you're making it harder for your rangers who get abused all the time anyway. Imagine what it's going to be like when this happens, they'd need bulletproof vests.

Michelle Carter: Thank you for your comments.

Audience (Speaker Seventeen): Hi, I live on Ashburner Street, I'm in the Isthmus zone and I got rid of my car last year and now what I do is I rely heavily on renting cars and car sharing. Now, with the scheme that you're proposing, I don't see how that can work for me based on the hiring cars from outside of my Isthmus zone. I regularly rent

**MINUTES OF NORTHERN BEACHES COUNCIL MANLY PARKING PERMIT ENGAGEMENT
SESSION
SATURDAY 7 SEPTEMBER 2019**

from; I think it's Budget up in North Manly. And I'm just wondering how you're going to manage that and encourage us to, if we want to take up their services, how can I be eligible to utilize car sharing services but be able to park in my street? I feel that you're penalizing me even though I have eligibility to park.

Michelle Carter: So, with car share they are eligible for permits, so car share and Pop Car now operate formally through Council, so we don't have any arrangements with any private hire companies under this.

Audience: So, places like Go Get and Car Next Door which I use a lot.

Michelle Carter: Yes, all of that.

Audience: And they're a lot more reasonable than Pop Share by the way. I rent but outside of my zone, so how do I bring that car into my zone where I believe I am eligible to park in my street? When I can battle the visitors and tourists, et cetera.

Michelle Carter: There is an option for a borrowed vehicle, but it really depends on how long you're borrowing sort of vehicle for. What you're saying, if you hire cars from a car hire agency, that's very difficult to manage through this scheme. I must be honest with that, but car share is manageable, car share will have the permits. Pop Car have the dedicated spaces, Go Get have floating. We will look to expand that and the-

Audience: Could you explain that a bit more where you're talking about floating? So, if I rent a car, say I rent a car from, say, for Car Next Door, I might rent it from an Ocean Beach Area, I might rent it from North Manly. How am I bringing that car back into my zone?

Michelle Carter: Into Isthmus?

Audience: Yes

Michelle Carter: What we'll be doing is looking at the car share and how it operates in Manly and now the permits float within the scheme area. But doesn't need to be an all scheme type of permit. That's something that we'll work with more on that to get the best fit for Manly. We want to encourage car share, absolutely. And there's more operators out there as well and trying to bring them in and get more car share happening and make it more visible and accessible as well. Because they can be tucked away a fair bit. So, we do we want to ... You're the perfect resident with no car, you borrow a car, car share. That's ideal, that's great. But we do-

Audience: It is ideal if I can park.

Michelle Carter: Yeah, if you can park and that's right. And in Isthmus you have really limited parking availability and we know that. But what you need to understand is all the businesses are pretty much in Isthmus and they are impacting on the street parking. So, by bringing in the business eligibility you should see a lot more parking availability from-

Audience: Yeah, I don't think it's just businesses though. I mean it's obviously the height of the ... because of the area right near beaches.

Michelle Carter: Yeah, that as well.

Audience (Speaker Eighteen): I just wanted to say, the two women in the front row, on either aisle, I absolutely 100% agree with everything they've been saying. I'll just say, the lady on the left, sorry I don't know your name, but she just put forward such good ideas and solutions. And back to your visitor parking scheme and tradesperson schemes, what you've put forward in your scheme I just don't know how it could possibly work and I do encourage you to work with people like this because it is perfect solutions.

Audience (Speaker Nineteen): Yeah, hi. My name is [REDACTED]. We live in Stuart Street over at Little Manly, so while you're looking at parking, I think you probably need to also add into the fact both trailers and boats, it has the same effect. On weekends we have boats permanently in our streets, some of them live full time. I've followed some of the owners, they don't live there at all. So that creates tremendous parking problems. With that also is the issue of Little Manly car park, Little Manly Cove car park specifically. So that Little Manly Point car park has unlimited parking, overnight as you just heard from my wife before, overnight parking. We have vans there, 7 by 24 sometimes living there. No rangers ever touching those and quite often noise coming from those vans at night-time. So why isn't that car park policed, one, with rangers? Two, changed to a paid, metered system? That would help and that would fund the Council's rangers to come back and police it properly as it should be.

Scott Taylor: I'm Scott Taylor, ranger coordinator. You can call our afterhours number, we have up to four rangers till 11:00 PM every night.

Audience: But they've instantly appeared after 11:00 PM or whenever, and then they're there all night.

Scott Taylor: Okay. I can only give your operational hours, if there are happening after those hours, please call Manly Police, get an event number and we'll pursue it.

Audience: They're busy so they won't come out.

Scott Taylor: Look, I understand that, and I mean we're doing alcohol patrols which is partly their job as well. So, we're trying to help the police trying to help the community. But call the 1-300, there are up to four rangers seven nights a week. And we can address what we can address.

Audience: Well, they set up their fairy lights in their van. Because they're there over ... based in this whole business holiday thing because no one's checking on them.

Scott Taylor: Could you just refresh my memory? Is the area signposted, "No overnight stays"?

Audience: Which is by the way pushed over in a bush - they're there all day.

Scott Taylor: I understand.

MINUTES OF NORTHERN BEACHES COUNCIL MANLY PARKING PERMIT ENGAGEMENT
SESSION
SATURDAY 7 SEPTEMBER 2019

Audience: And people come and park there, grab their briefcase and walk down to the ferry to go to the city for work. So, they're there all day

Scott Taylor: Maybe we can adjust the 10P.

Michelle Carter: We've taken that on notice to look at. We'd have to speak with the community on getting the right fit, would it be a 2P a 4P, what would work.

Audience: We'd love to see more rangers.

Michelle Carter: Yeah, noted as well. Note that.

Audience: And the boat trailer thing.

Michelle Carter: Ah, the boat trailers. Yeah, so now there are now you can get a permit for a boat trailer or a caravan or something like that. But we're proposing through the draft framework not to issue them to boat trailers, caravans or trailers. Yeah. In an area that experiences high parking demand, because you have many properties that don't have any off-street parking, so we need to ensure that the residents are the priority when it comes to parking. So those with no off street are the highest priority. So, having boat trailers or caravans taking up those spaces does impact on parking availability for people who need it. Thank you. So, we'll take on note the ... We'll move onto the next question.

Audience (Speaker Twenty) – I live on Eurobin Avenue, where Stella Maris College is. And I complained to the ranger about the girls parking and he said, "Oh, they come out every two hours and move their car." Because I've come home and had to drive somewhere else for a couple of hours because I haven't been able to park outside my house. And I have a handicapped car park sticker because I have a problem walking. And I really have a problem and there are two that I know of, properties on my street, that don't use their driveways. And that makes me angry, because it's not fair. Number 41 never uses their driveway, there are four units there so they all park on the street. I mean at least one could do it. And, one of our new residents applied and asked if we could make parking in our front garden, but it's not deep enough so we can't do that. I'd like to have a handicapped parking spot right outside my building so that I could park when I get home.

Michelle Carter – What number were you?

Audience – ■

Michelle Carter – ■ Okay, thank you.

Audience (Speaker Twenty-One) - I would like to suggest that the parking for residents be linked to registration numbers for the people that live in the area for two reasons. Some residents might own a trailer which they're going to need to put somewhere and if the parking's not available for trailers then where are they going to put their trailer? And the other thing is that some residents may only actually have one car, so they don't need two permits. And the other thing is the limit of the framework to being two hours, I really think that could be extended to four hours, because then that

**MINUTES OF NORTHERN BEACHES COUNCIL MANLY PARKING PERMIT ENGAGEMENT
SESSION
SATURDAY 7 SEPTEMBER 2019**

would help a lot of businesses going with customers coming in. They would be able to help the businesses.

Michelle Carter – So changes the 2P, extend it to four – okay thank you.

Audience – This is more out of area parking putting more pressure on residents.

Michelle Carter - It does, yeah. It does then create like what you've got on the beach front with the 4P. I understand. It could happen, yeah, it's something we can look at. But it would need to be undertaken, I guess, in consultation with people living in the scheme areas to get that right.

Audience (Speaker Twenty-Two) - Hi, hi. I'm in the Balgowlah permit parking scheme. Now, I worked for two and a half years to get that implemented in consultation with the mayor, the general manager, the RMS. I had two face to face meetings with the RMS and we had ... We were successful in getting a very good, which is currently a very effective, parking scheme. It's a one-hour parking scheme from 8:00 AM to 10:00 PM, it works very well. In fact, the fact that it, within two weeks of it implementing, we had basically all-day commuters that basically parked in the scheme, in the area, walked up and took a bus. All day they were there from seven o'clock in the morning till seven o'clock at night. Virtually within two weeks we had 65% drop in parkers there. The scheme now works. It's been in for eight years, works perfectly. Now, if we take Mrs [REDACTED] point and we take, sorry I don't know your surname, [REDACTED] point and we implement [REDACTED] point as far as the permit as an asset to the property. In other words, you, to apply for a permit, you've got to go down to the Council, apply for it, give your name, your address, your birthday, your DNA, right? Then you get your spot. Why don't you put a line, and I don't know if this is a contravention to the local government act, why don't you put a line there, "If you transfer ..." Of course, it says non-transferable, but you've got to spell that out. In other words, "If you transfer it to someone else there's a \$5,000 penalty." Right? I guarantee you, 40% of the permits people wouldn't bother taking the risk of selling them online if they know they're going to have a threat of a \$5,000 fine. Number one. Number two, Mrs [REDACTED] point about the Manly parking. If you address that too, if you just address those two issues and sit back for 18 months and address it then. Because what you're doing now is, you're adding upon layer upon layer upon layer for something that doesn't work and ultimately it will, if it hasn't burst, it's going to burst and it's going to be disastrous. So, you're adding layers onto something that ... You need to address those two issues that those two ladies have spoken about, put a penalty, a severe penalty if that's permitted. I don't know if it's permitted under the act. Sit back and see. Your parking will probably free up and from then you can then decide, then you can build with consultation from the community. It won't be as heated, that's all I have to say.

Michelle Carter: Okay. Thank you. There's a lot of interest in this project. It really does, every single person living in the scheme area will be impacted. So, I think what I'm hearing today from everyone in the room and through the comments coming through is that you do support something linked to vehicle registration. Okay, you do support that and you do support the residential eligibility, so living in the property and having that vehicle registration printed on the actual permit.

Audience: I know that we feel we need one for our tradespeople.

MINUTES OF NORTHERN BEACHES COUNCIL MANLY PARKING PERMIT ENGAGEMENT
SESSION
SATURDAY 7 SEPTEMBER 2019

Michelle Carter: Can you just let me finish please? Okay?

Audience: We do need one that's not attached to people.

Michelle Carter: Okay, just let me just do the recap. So, I guess in general for the residential scheme, for how we apply resident permits, that's what we're hearing from the community. We're hearing that you don't want us to look at your off-street spaces at all, okay? And that's in the first year we weren't proposing to do that. Does that need to be a longer review period? Because from what I can see is that by bringing in the vehicle registration, the eligibility, that will really make a big difference in the area. And that's where we need to monitor and do, we need more than one year of the new eligibility framework in place? And I'm happy to work with the community and hear feedback on that through the submission process as to whether that needs to be extended, but we do ... I must be honest with you; we do need to address the off-street parking as well.

Audience: It is not an approved scheme. The RTA approved these existing schemes. It's in place, you just haven't managed it properly. You've got an approved, existing scheme.

Michelle Carter: We own that 100%, yeah. So, through our processes of managing and through the eligibility and registration, but from what Miss [REDACTED] has referred to about the need for the visitors and the tradespeople. Hey, we're hearing we haven't got that right, okay?

Audience: In North Sydney the visitor parking does not work. I must only visit a friend for an hour because otherwise she must give up her one day scratchy.

Michelle Carter: Sure, okay. It doesn't work for here, how do we manage that in a way that still doesn't allow that black market?

Audience: You need to get rid of the out of towners, the people who are flaunting the system first. Strip out the noise first and then focus in on the problem.

Michelle Carter: Yeah, so through the management of the scheme, the eligibility-

Audience: Which is the way you're going people; everyone acknowledges how difficult it is. But you could just get a much better structure, a much tighter structure, right? Because now you're making decisions on an inflated situation. And you don't know what that inflated situation is.

Michelle Carter: It could be absolutely, and that's what we need to monitor. That's what we need to do.

Audience: ... But that doesn't mean that you don't adhere to the RMS guidelines, but it makes your job whole lot easier and lot less complicated.

Michelle Carter: Thank you everyone for coming today. We've heard form a lot of members of the community.

**MINUTES OF NORTHERN BEACHES COUNCIL MANLY PARKING PERMIT ENGAGEMENT
SESSION
SATURDAY 7 SEPTEMBER 2019**

Audience (Speaker Twenty-Three) - I'd like somebody to address the problem of those people who do not use their driveways.

Michelle Carter - Well, that comes back to the off-street consideration that many people don't support us bringing in. They don't support us doing that and we're hearing that today and we're hearing conflicting views. So, we're going to have this battle. There's a lot of people that told us we must bring in the off-street parking requirements and they're not in the room here today as in numbers of people who don't want us to look at off street. So that's something we need to get a fit that works for the community, okay?

Audience – When I read through the consultation, so I didn't see that very strong. Yes, in certain areas like Isthmus and so on, people saying people should use their off street. I didn't see it across the board. In Ocean Beach we, honestly where I live, we do not have a problem with parking. And so, you're sitting there saying, "Manly's got a terrible problem." And you speak to anybody in our street and everybody will say the same thing, "We never have a problem with parking in our street." Others just next, two, three down do, okay, fair enough. But this is a blunt instrument that you're looking at putting across people and punishing us. And the off-street thing, just to pick up on that, many people can't use their off street. If they put their car on their driveway, they couldn't get their bins out, they couldn't access their cars. There's lots and lots of things, there might be one person parked further in. If they parked, people that have got their ... bikes can't get through. Yes, there are certain people that could put their cars up on driveways, but to make a blanket statement of saying that, "Everybody has to drive." So, if you come home for five minutes to go in to grab something, and if your car's out the front, because you're not entitled to have it there and the ranger comes along you will get booked. Because you've come back, you've forgotten something, you've run inside. It is an unworkable, unfair, discriminatory system that you're proposing.

Michelle – Thank you. Thank you everyone for coming. We really need to wrap up the session today.

Audience (Speaker Twenty-Four) - In the Ferry Bower area, all right? With respect to the ranger behind me, I really, having lived there for nearly 25 years, noticed a drop off in the number of rangers and the policing of car parking by visitors, probably since the Council merger, all right? If you enforce that two-hour restriction in the Ferry Bower area, I'm sure that will help to free up street parking availability. Particularly on weekends and from the change of seasons from now on through to autumn, I could tell you as a resident of Bower Street, you just got to pray for a park, all right? And you ring up people, people have parked over your driveway, I can't get through. I get a recorded message, sometimes I get the message, "Oh well, if it's a hazard, do you think it's a hazard? Call the police." You ring the police, Constable [REDACTED] on the front desk who's about as interested as listening to someone parked over your driveway as a fly to the moon. It's just you need to increase the policing of the two-hour limit in that Ferry Bower area, and I think that will also help the problem.

Michelle Carter - Thank you for your question. We'll take that on board, we have heard a lot about enforcement coming through. We are wrapping up today, so thank you for coming. I'm sure a lot of you will come back next Tuesday and Wednesday and we

**MINUTES OF NORTHERN BEACHES COUNCIL MANLY PARKING PERMIT ENGAGEMENT
SESSION
SATURDAY 7 SEPTEMBER 2019**

really would welcome you to come. Really good ideas, good feedback, we're hearing some strong themes here. But the engagement's open to the 29th of September so please continue to put your questions up and also to write to us and we'll review that and make that decision with the input that you give us as to what we will implement or put forward for recommendations. But I think we must sort of own that there does need to be some change to the eligibility, the vehicle registration and the how Council manages that to make it better and fairer for everybody. So, thank you for coming today. Please see one of our staff if you'd like to follow, learn how to follow the project or find anything on the Your Say page. Thank you.

Meeting Close – 10.29AM